# ASSESSMENT OF NFE COMPONENTS UNDERTAKEN BY THE PARTNER ORGNIZATIONS OF SAVE THE CHILDRERN SWEDEN DENMARK



Consultant

M. Nazmul Haq

Consultancy Report Submitted to Save the Children Sweden Denmark Dhaka, Bangladesh 31 July 2005

# **Executive Summary**

This review intends to provide a comprehensive picture of the quality non formal education and inclusiveness of the education programmes offered by the partner organizations of SCSD. The review was undertaken on the basis of discussion with teachers, students and parents of the NGOs.

Modality of education in all the partners is more or less similar but there are differences in the clientele group. Large numbers of children with various special backgrounds are still excluded from formal and targeted non-formal education programmes among the partners.

The total contact hour of the NFE programme is limited to two hours a day or 12 hours a week. Teaching is very much stereotype in NFE school, everything is predetermined and set; the materials, methods and even the procedure all are ritualistically maintained. Teacher in non formal school has very little scope to change the method or content if so ever necessary. No teacher is permanently employed for any programme nor does he/she receive sufficient training for the task.

NGOs like CPD, SEEP, SUF and INCIDIN work with working children living only in *Behari* communities and urban slums, Shoishab Bangladesh educate the children who are engaged in domestic work, BPF and BNWLA are involved in more closed to inclusive type of education with disabled and abused children along with other general kids. BITA and Uddipan in Chittagong work with formal school children and school dropouts in rural areas respectively. So SCSD's programme in a sense is inclusive in terms of coverage. Except BPF none of these organizations could involve mainstream children in their schools.

The challenge of inclusion lies with the types of school and curriculum. Unless the infrastructural pattern of school house, quality of teacher, learning materials to study etc. conform with the general category of school and the curriculum meets the requirements of greater community it would not be easy to bring all children in one setup for education.

As majority of these NFE graduates are working and older to peer groups so there is a potential threat to dropout from the mainstream course while studying in school. It is very much essential to address all the needs prior to include these children in the mainstream schools.

The organizations running NFE programme have serious problem with curriculum, neither the SCSD could fix up a curriculum for them nor they could find a suitable curriculum for their own programme. Therefore, several curricula emerged (adapted and based on national curriculum) for the purpose.

It is quite unlikely for the NFE centres to get good result with formal school curriculum and its primers. In this curriculum duration of courses, number of books, total contact hour, all are pre set so any change in them would not bring good result. The age and cultural context of the working and marginalized children are different from the children intended by the NCTB curriculum, therefore, use of this curriculum for non formal out of school or working children would be somewhat problematic. The major shortcoming of the curriculum developed by any NGO is that they do not have any list of competencies that they desire to provide through their own education programme.

However, despite challenging difference between the formal and non formal children the adapted curriculum could bring some positive change in the learners such as acquisition of literacy, numeracy and life skills. Both the children and their parents or employers endorse the change with great satisfaction. The review team considers the adapted curriculum as a stop gap arrangement. Organizations should be encouraged to adopt a more reliable and authorized curriculum for the purpose.

At present no organization is rightly adopted a curriculum which is inclusive in its true sense. Children with diversified disadvantaged background like, domestic workers, children involved in high risk profession, children from socially handicapped communities all are served but in exclusionary approach. There is no list of competencies developed yet for the NFE students in SCSD programme.

The major shortcomings of primers (other then NCTB books) used in SCSD programmes are that they were not developed on the basis of any adequate scientific principle or spiral need of curriculum. Contents in the books seem to be quite exhaustive (and found overloaded in case of Shaishob Bangladesh and CPD) but their placement in chapters seems to be random. Text density varies from chapter to chapter but it is not sequentially arranged.

There is provision of supplementary readings for the children through the innovative approach of children's club. This club provides opportunity of extra reading, learning a vocational skills like music, art, cutting, knitting etc. through additional training. However, the opportunities are not available to all children; only those who reside near to the club or willing to attend can avail the opportunity.

Children take part largely in children's club where they have scope to organize their own cultural and educational programme, give their choices to select books, and other reading materials etc. But in this case also elderly persons dominate the policy formulation and taking final decisions.

There are some training opportunities for the children in the club such as dress making, cooking and making handicrafts. Other than these training there are opportunities to learn music and dance for the children. Children learn to perform through this club and make them smarter.

Hardly any organization could provide suitable training to their teachers, most of the NGOs provided 3-6 day foundation training with a daylong refresher training per month. Another weakness of this training is that the foundation training is not provided by any recognized body of trainers following a standard syllabus.

Out of nine NGOs except INCIDIN and SUF no one has a room can be suitably termed as classroom. These rooms are situated in the residence of a beneficiary or in a place where children can meet for study. Most of such place is very much inadequate for free learning. In this room children sit on mat cramped with difficulty. There is no space to move or play around for doing any learning exercise.

Use of teaching aid is very limited in the class. Creation of fun and joyful learning is present to some extent; in this regard teacher involves the children in play and reciting rhymes in between two classes. Children can play in class and draw with colour pencils etc. These co-curricular activities are limited to indoor activities only, outdoor activities are absent.

Several of the NGOs have succeeded in mainstreaming children into government schools on completion of grade III in the NFE centres. Organizations that are mainstreaming children from NFE centres into government schools follow them for a few months only. NGO workers also focus on building relationships with teachers of these schools and other influential persons for obtaining better service for the mainstreamed children. However, no data is available about the children who could finish primary or secondary education after NFE.

The children who are younger in age and close to the school going cohort are easily accepted by the school than the older children. The children coming from non formal school face a culture shock in the regular school. Teachers and students in formal school do not have any idea about vulnerability of the NFE children so they treat them either equally with the regular group of children or consider them weak and disrespectful in the class.

#### Recommendations

The following are few recommendations that are forwarded to improve the project activities at large and develop the quality of education in specific.

1. Non formal and inclusive education is a new strategy in the education programme, it requires thorough knowledge and understanding of education, psychology, disability and clear conception about the under privileged children's community in the society. Organizations who work in this area are not rightly oriented with all these disciplines and hence rely on a person who has some experiences in this field. In order to get good result from the project the initial requirement is to recruit persons with

- sufficient pedagogical background and develop them through continuous training for inclusive and non formal education projects. There is shortage of such persons in both SCSD as well as in their partner organizations. Therefore, sufficiently trained personnel in the field of education are to be produced through internal and overseas training on inclusive, non formal and child rights based education.
- The classroom environment among most of the partners' school is very poor. Children sit on mat in an un-specious room having no or little space to move and work. Arrangement for an acceptable classroom should be made so that children can have an idea of better schooling even in a non formal setting.
- Other then books an chalkboard teachers have very little materials to use as teaching aids. In order to build up concepts teachers should use large number of teaching aids in class. Provisions should be created to procure more teaching learning for effective teaching in class.
- 4. At present SCSD partners are using various curricula for their non formal education programmes. How far these curricula are suitable for the disadvantageous group of children is not very clear so in this respect a unified standardized curriculum is required. This can be done by developing a standardized, right based and inclusive curriculum for the underprivileged and discriminated group of children. SCSD in collaboration with a specialized institute or group of curriculum experts may develop the curriculum for the purpose. While developing a new inclusive education curriculum for the disadvantaged group of children former DNFE curricula and their primers may be used as a stop gap arrangement.
- 5. There is crisis of basic learning materials like primers for the children in the SCSD's NFE programme. Falling under such circumstances NGOs tend to use materials developed by NCTB, BRAC, Dhaka Ahsania Mission or some other sources which are not equally competent to be standard primers. In this regard appropriate primers have to be selected and specified on the basis of standardized curriculum for the whole programme so that the learners' achievement can be compared at a later stage.
- 6. In order to make the teaching more effective it would have been better if one type of primer could be utilized for a particular age group of children for all the organizations. SCSD may consider a unified type of curriculum and specific primers for their own funded programme instead of giving them liberty to use any materials.
- 7. There is a scope for using supplementary learning materials for the NFE learners through the club but it was observed that a significant number of children could not avail the chance due to distance or time constraint. If the proportion of children's club can be increased then it is possible to bring them at the doorsteps of children. In this case at least one child club should be established for at least five NFE centres for successful use of supplementary learning materials.
- 8. Teacher training in the SCSD NFE projects suffer from various shortcomings like shorter duration, availability of experience trainers and good training materials. So in order to provide appropriate training for teachers a third party experienced in TOT or a professional training organization may be assigned to do the job. Before the training is on the syllabus has to be developed with the emphasis on inclusive education.

- However, the NFE curriculum has to be prepared first prior to giving effective teacher training.
- 9. As the teachers are poorly qualified in the partners organizations their training should be rigorous and sufficiently prolonged to supplement the lack of formal education with any degree.
- 10. Children's club is an excellent idea for developing the quality of their education and future. As the numbers of clubs are few the opportunities cannot be availed by a large number of them. In order to bring the opportunity to the doorsteps of the children more clubs are to be set up and multiple facilities (like vocational and a vocational training, dissemination of various advocacy materials, recreation etc.) have to be created for maximum benefit.
- 11. Mainstreaming of children graduated from the NFE schools has created a challenge for enrolling them in appropriate grade and sustaining them in the school for the stipulated time. The challenges come from the educational level of the student, his/her socio-cultural status and accommodating schooling hour for the working child. The situation can be tackled by establishing a high school with non formal modality in the same locality. Selected number of children graduating from several primary levels NFE schools (as it is not possible or plausible to mainstream cent percent of children to high school) can be enrolled in this non formal high school (NFHS) and can continue their education for at least next five years. This opportunity will provide flexible school timing and comparable teaching learning exercises with previous school.
- 12. The idea of inclusiveness is not complete among the partners and the teachers of the NFE schools. For that matter children with diversified abilities are not included in the same school or in the same class rather children with similar disabilities, coming from same disadvantaged community or equal ability groups are taken exclusively for education. This strategy should be changed to inclusive approach where children from diversified ability grouping would be included. In order to do this separate training on inclusive education has to be provided for the teachers, supervisors and managers of the organization.
- 13. The amount of vocational training provided by the partners is limited to some trades only this can be increased to more vocations depending upon the availability of jobs and likings of the children. Partner organization may higher external experts to provide those training for the willing children.
- 14. The emphasis on disability is very limited in the programme except one no other organization receives disabled children in their school. This is because the people working over there are either not appropriately qualified in handling disability or do not have sufficient materials for the children having specific kind of disability. Therefore, the SCSD NFE programme should draw the attention of the organizations that at least 5% of the children in each class should be taken from the disabled community (either physical or intellectual) and for that matter all teachers and supervisors should receive training on the subject of special and inclusive education. IER, Dhaka University provides a weeklong training on Special and Inclusive Education for the teachers and social workers that may be explored for the SCSD partners.

# Content

Executive summary	ii
Introduction Background Overview of NFE among the partners General objective Specific objectives Methodology Limitation of the review	1 1 2 3 3 4
Lessons of the programme The education through NFE approach The concerns of inclusion Curriculum: the stumbling block of NFE Learning materials: the primers Teacher training Children's participation The classroom scenario Children's club Mainstreaming the children's education	5 6 7 9 11 12 12 13
Individual Partners' Assessment  1. BNWLA 2. CPD 3. SEEP 4. SUF 5. INSIDIN 6. SHOISHAB BANGLADESH 7. UDDIPAN 8. BPF 9. BITA	16 16 18 22 26 29 32 34 37
Discussion and Policy Implications	41
Recommendations	44

#### Introduction

# **Background**

In order to bring a positive change in the lives of Bangladeshi girls and boys irrespective of their socio-economic and psycho-physical characteristics Save the Children Sweden – Denmark (SCSD) developed a new strategic plan for the year 2005 to 2010. This plan identified a thematic area of education through which they want to bring the change in the children's lives. This plan intends to increase the number of boys' and girls' participation in the process of education and derive benefits from it. On the other hand SCSD works in favour of creating a quality basic and inclusive education for developing an effective and humanistic education for the future generation of the country. Non Formal Education (NFE) and Inclusive Education (IE) is used in the broad sense to mean the reduction and removal of barriers to access, participation and learning of all children especially those who are marginalized due to poverty, disability, gender, caste and ethnicity. SCSD takes the approach of education as the right to children instead of kind provision.

The education programme of SCSD is a joint scheme with Save the children UK, focusing on challenging and changing exclusionary policies and practices of the education system and hold the government accountable of its obligations under PEDP II, PRSP and National Plan of Action II for Education for All (EFA) so that the education system becomes more inclusive and qualitative. Though SCSD firmly believes it is the responsibility of the government to provide quality education to all children in Bangladesh, the fact remains that some children are unable to access and complete education in the formal education system due to the inflexibility of the education system, discrimination and poverty. In order to address these gaps, non-formal education institutions have been established so that children from marginalized groups can access and complete a quality education. A number of partner organizations of SCSD support non-formal primary education programme for marginalized children such as children with disabilities, working children and children from minority communities. These partners also have expressed their eagerness to improve the quality and inclusiveness of the education components, feeling the need to provide flexible non formal and primary education programmes that address the diverse needs of disadvantaged children. Thus this study intends to review the NFE activities in the SCSD's partners' organizations to the extent that how far they could address the diversified needs of these communities and maintain the inclusiveness either individually or collectively amongst them.

#### Overview of NFE among the partners

This section provides an overview of non formal education currently undertaken by the partners under the SCSD subvention. It reveals that the partners are working to achieve a common goal of protecting children from the hazardous work by ensuring education and skill training through non formal

education with various durations. While providing opportunities to education boys and girls who are engaged in comparatively more hazardous and risky work are given preference. Other than working children, trafficking, abused and disabled children are also involved in the education programme of the organizations. But it is found that none of the organizations involve all types in a single group rather by an exclusionary principle they handle one or two groups of disadvantaged children in a single programme. Thus BNWLA (Bangladesh National Women Lawyers Association) works with the abandoned, abused and trafficking children; CPD (Community Participation and Development), CEEP (Social and Economic Enhancement Programme), SUF (Society for Underprivileged Families) and INCIDIN (Integrated Community and Industrial Development Initiative in Bangladesh) are involved in educating the working Behari children along with some other non Behari children. Shoishab Bangladesh is working with another challenging group of domestic workers and Uddipan at Chittagong works with rural never enrolled or school dropouts. Another organization BITA at Chittagong has different programme of non formal education; their approach is theater based education with formal and non formal school children. The last one BPF (Bangladesh Protibondhi Foundation) is the only one organization works with formal inclusive education for both able and disabled children in one programme. Again BPF includes only intellectually retarded children only.

Out of 9 partners, 4 partner organizations are providing NFE comparable up to grade III such as, CPD, SEEP, Shoishab Bangladesh and Uddipan. Two organizations like SUF & INCIDIN provide education to children up to grades VIII but in different duration. SUF take four years to give this education while INCIDIN takes up 8 years to impart children's education up to grade VIII. The educational style of BNWLA is more challenging in the matter of provision. As the children are not permanent in the shelter homes so they cannot continue their education for a specified period like grades III, V or VIII but they can continue as far as they can. Those who are relatively permanent in the shelter home and capable students are mainstreamed in the nearby school. In this way children can go up to grade ten. BPF and BITA are the two organizations who run their programme on education in quite different ways. BPF run the formal education through an inclusive approach, in this school they have children from nursery to grades V. In each class they have about 10 to 20 percent children having intellectual deficiencies along with the regular intelligent children study with their age mates. BITA is the only organization who does not have any regular school but they have link programme with the regular formal schools. Unlike other programme BITA educate children through theatre and workshops. Their education has tremendous effect on children and learning takes place instantly. Here children learn through vicarious conditioning and go to action with emotional attachment.

#### The general objective

The general objective of the study is to provide a comprehensive picture of the quality and inclusiveness of the education programmes being offered by the partner organizations of SCSD.

#### The specific objectives

The specific objectives of the study are as follows:

- 1. To provide the status of education programme for children with disadvantaged group among the working partners of SCSD.
- 2. To evaluate the quality of education provided by the partners in terms of teaching learning strategies, extent of inclusiveness and possibilities of mainstreaming.
- 3. To determine the strengths and weaknesses of the education programmes particularly in the matter of provisions and inclusiveness.
- To provide recommendations in order to improve the quality of education and make the education programme more inclusive and continuing towards mainstreaming for future development of children.

# Methodology

In order to perform data collection more qualitative approach was adopted. In the process, the investigator visited all nine organizations spending two days at each organization. On the first day he talked to the management, reviewed the curriculum, materials, and explored the possible ways of improvement in education and mainstreaming children in formal schools. On the second visit the investigator observed the classroom teaching for the whole day (school hour) and talked to teachers, students and parent/employer for their comments about the educational activities.

During classroom observation teacher's performance and teaching-learning activities were evaluated. How the teacher delivers his/her curriculum was critically examined and his/her level of interaction was also assessed. Teacher's teaching capacity, his/her popularity in class and leadership were also examined through critical observation.

Selection of learning centre and students were purposive i.e., the available centre and volunteer students and parents were interviewed. All the interviews were purposive and in-depth; the investigator led the discussion and asked questions relevant to their education programme. Students' reading and writing abilities were assessed through their classroom performances. The parents/employers were asked to give their perceptions about the learning centre's education and children's achievement. Their future expectation and possible modifications were also discussed with them.

Finally a focus group discussion (FGD) was conducted with a group of managers and supervisors of the organization. The purpose of this FGD was to develop a comprehensive idea about the problems and prospects of the programme.

#### Limitation of the review

- This is a short term review of the programmes of nine NGOs running NFE with the support from SCSD. All the programmes are limited to a particular area and confined to a particular group of beneficiaries.
- Only one centre of each organization was visited and selected teacher, students and parents/employers were interviewed with limited scope.
- Teacher student interaction was observed in the classroom only, and as the students completed their first year cycle their changes in behaviour and psycho-social manner could not be determined with conclusive remark.
- Materials reviewed were also limited to primers only.

# The Lessons Learnt from the Programme

# **Education through NFE approach**

Providing education to children of any ability or caste and creed is a constitutional obligation of the government. This responsibility has been negotiated through various national and regional programmes and projects on education. Parallel to these governmental initiatives increasing focus and commitment from the NGOs and donors have been generated to support education for the children. Tangible changes can be seen in policy formulation, chalking out programmes like second Primary Education Development Programme (PEDP II), and emphasizing on access, equity and quality of education. Key government commitments for the future include focus on improving quality in education, inclusive education and decentralized management specially with increasing emphasis on community participation in school management. Other emphasis are early childhood care and development (ECCD), teacher training, education for the children who remain outside school (ROSC – Reaching Out of School Children) etc.

As it is a difficult task on the part of government alone to provide education to all categories of children large number of NGOs and donors came forward with their technical and financial support to assist succeed government plans. After abolition of Directorate of Non Formal Education (DNFE) in 2003 the agenda came under direct supervision of MOPME and concerns were developed to provide quality education to all children through various organizations and means. Several non-formal education initiatives for the disadvantaged and 'hard to reach children' continued with the non governmental supports. The government has formed a small team headed by a Joint Secretary to look into NFE matters and has recently announced a substantial increase in the budgetary provision for primary along with the non-formal educations.

The issue of improving quality of education is complex because there are weaknesses in the structure and environment where most children remain passive learners. Large numbers of children with various special backgrounds are still excluded from formal and targeted non-formal education programmes in terms of access and participation. Responding to equal rights and opportunities of all children is still a critical issue. Therefore, in order to address these issues innovative strategies with non formal education have been adopted by both government and NGOs with their limited resources.

SCSD in this regard provides financial support to nine NGOs to conduct their NFE programme for the underprivileged children and children with various disabilities. Though the intention of SCSD was to encourage inclusiveness of education yet it could not be achieved in most of the cases. Process of education in all the partners is more or less same but there are differences in the clientele group whom they serve. So in one way or another it hampers the inclusiveness principle. The total contact hour of NFE programme is limited to two hours a day or 12 hours a week. This timing seem sufficient for providing

functional literacy to any group of children. But as the intention of the SCSD's projects is to provide education equivalent to formal grades III to VIII (depending upon the organization) this timing is not sufficient. In the school children need more time to internalize the concepts, values and attitudes what they receive in the class.

Teaching is very much conventional in NFE school, everything is predetermined and set; the materials, methods and even the procedure all are ritualistically maintained. Teacher in non formal school has little scope to change the method or content if so ever necessary. No teacher is permanently employed for any programme nor does he/she receive appropriate training for the task. The teachers are characterized by poor education, marginalized training, insufficient wage and burdened with non teaching activities in the community.

# Nature of partners' education programme

The intention of the partners' education programme is to provide basic education to children that is comparable to formal education grades III, V or VIII depending upon the NGOs. All the NGOs follow a curriculum similar to BRAC or NCTB's one but none of them follow these curricula in exact form rather they use adapted version of these curricula for their target groups. The partner's education is an alternative education programme, i.e., it is a second chance for some who missed education in due time for some social or economic reasons or due to dropping out from school for economic or other reasons. These children demand extra care and support for education for attaining to the level of their peers in formal school.

All the partners' education programme follow non formal approach of face to face education. The schools are located in learners' own locality and sits in a house particularly in one room (except those who run full school like SUF, INCIDIN and BPF). The NFE schools have one school, one class and one teacher (except the full schools) and they run for different durations ranging from two to five years with the same group of children. The one room NFE schools meet for two hours a day and six days a week.

#### Concerns of inclusion in the programmes

Inclusive education system values diversity with emphasis on child rights. It treats students, staff, faculty and parents as a community of learners. It assumes that with good teaching every child – normal or special – can learn provided proper environment is given with encouragement and meaningful activities. SCSD's major concern in education is inclusion and non-discrimination of children in the school. This resulted in incorporating other disadvantaged groups like working children, children subjected to violence and abuse, trafficking children etc. The other concern emerges from the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) that every child should get equal

opportunity of education through school which is meaningful, participatory and child friendly.

Considering the above issues SCSD intends to focus on education recognizing the importance of including disability, avoiding discrimination, creating provision for child protection, and include the exploited and trafficking children into the mainstream education, i.e., to support a programme which is inclusive as a whole. Thus their fund spread over activities covering all the above specialties included in the school programme. Initially they started with disability and gradually other issues emerged. Now in the year 2005 all the issues came under the funded programme of SCSD but through separate organizations. Though it was expected that various types of special need children will come under the same programme but in practice it became very challenging to keep them together.

NGOs like CPD, SEEP and INCIDIN work exclusively with working children living only in Behari communities and urban slums, SUF provide education to working as well as local poor children in shanty towns, Shoishab Bangladesh educate the children who are engaged in domestic work, BPF and BNWLA are involved in more closed to inclusive type of education with disabled and abused children along with other general kids. BITA and Uddipan in Chittagong work with formal school children and school dropouts in rural areas respectively. So SCSD's programme in a sense is inclusive in terms of coverage. Except BPF school none of the organization could involve mainstream children in their schools. Several explanations came in favour of such exclusionary approaches. Firstly, the school runs in such a house what does not look like a school to the mainstream children. Secondly, the number of special need children in the group is so large that other children (regular group) cannot consider it to be a place for their education i.e., they find the school for working class or of a particular group only. Thirdly, the curriculum is adapted to the needs of such special group children that the mainstream kids do not find interest in them. The challenge of inclusion lies with the types of school and curriculum. NGOs are not developing/repairing the curriculum as per the need of the children. Unless the infrastructural pattern of school house, quality of teacher, learning materials to study etc. conform with the general category of school and the curriculum meets the requirements of greater community it would not be easy to bring all children in one setup for education. However, the children receiving education through exclusionary approach (i.e., different special needs are dealt with different type of schools independently and all schools run under the same programme umbrella) are unique by character; there are very few mainstream schools who would receive them for education with commitment and dedication. Moreover, these children or their parents are unable to fit them into the mainstream school timing and curriculum.

It is assumed that a significant portion of the children receive education through NGOs would be mainstreamed after completing education in the respective learning centres. This is also a big challenge in the part of NGO graduates who would be enrolled in the formal school. As majority of these children are working and older to peer groups so there is a potential threat to

dropout from the course while studying in school. Various factors are associated with the education of children having the special needs such as, schooling time, motivation for education, family support, private cost for education, distance from residence, school environment, teacher commitment, supportive curriculum etc. It is very much essential to address all the needs prior to include these children in the mainstream schools. Otherwise an alternative strategy to provide non formal secondary education has to be developed where majority of these components will be present. Though SUF and INCIDIN have already undertaken education programme up to grade VIII from their set up and are planning (INCIDIN) to establish linkage with Open University for the SSC certificate. This model can be adopted by other NGOs for their selected learners who would be able to continue education beyond grade five.

#### Curriculum: the stumbling block to NFE

The NFE programme supported by SCSD has largely generated form the felt need of serving the un-served group of children and their families. The other intention of the programme is to adopt education with child rights approach and in more inclusive environment. The intention has been translated into different projects of non-formal education. But the organizations running each programme have serious problem with curriculum, neither the SCSD could fix up a curriculum for them nor they could find a suitable curriculum for their own programme. Therefore, several curricula emerged (adapted and based on national curriculum) for the purpose. Majority of the organizations (SEEP, SUF, BNWLA, INCIDIN, Uddipan) adopted the national formal curriculum, others (BITA, Shoishab Bangladesh) created a curriculum for their own clientele group. Curriculum is pivotal to any education programme and that has to be developed in a very professional way but most organizations do not have any curriculum expert to take professional decisions or run the programme with long term perspective. Programme managers and supervisors always struggle with curriculum and in the absence of proper technical knowledge they work with syllabi and text materials only which are only parts of curriculum.

A curriculum is developed after a long painstaking process of workshop, field trial, and testing and retesting etc. Any curriculum developed nationally follows somewhat similar procedure. However, any ad hoc curriculum developed by an individual or an independent group is unlikely to adopt such procedure to produce a standardized curriculum so it would not be able to provide the result that a standardized curriculum would do. On the other had, a curriculum developed for an intended group is not suitable for another group unless it is duly modified. The NGOs who are using the NCTB curriculum for their NFE programme are actually dealing with a big challenge. It is quite unlikely for the NFE centres to get good result with formal school curriculum and the books. This is a curriculum where duration of courses, number of books, total contact hour, subject wise differential contact hours all are pre set and schools are supposed to follow the same rule with utmost consistency. Any change in the curriculum would not be able to bring the predicted

outcome, instead that may face new challenges which would not be easy to resolve by any means.

The NGOs who are using the NCTB curriculum for their working and destitute children cannot follow the prerequisite conditions given in the curriculum. That is the time allotted for each grade, specific primer with particular mode of teaching and learning exercises, examination and promotion policy, all are specified in the curriculum. It is not possible to follow the specified and recommended procedures in the NFE centres. So the difference in inputs and outcomes in formal and non formal schools prevails. The age and cultural context of the working and marginalized children are different from the children intended by the NCTB curriculum, therefore, use of this curriculum for non formal out of school or working children would be somewhat problematic. This comment seems true when we realize that some subject or topics from the national curriculum is dropped (e.g., English is dropped by Shoishab Bangladesh) for their difficulty or redundancy for the disadvantaged children. Similarly, un-standardized curriculum developed by any individual or organization (as in the case of CPD) may not provide the appropriate result what an evaluation team expects.

Unfortunately in the current SCSD NFE effort most of the NGOs who are using the NCTB curriculum adapted it as per their own requirement. And again the adaptation was done on the basis of their own judgment disregarding any scientific procedure of change. However, despite such challenging adaptation or creation of new NFE curriculum positive change in the learners functional literacy were observed i.e., children could acquire literacy, numeracy and life skills. Both the children and their parents or employers endorse the change with great satisfaction. The review team considers such change as partial but not the whole. Unless learners master all the competencies indicated in curriculum it is not the whole achievement. Such weaknesses may be covered by teaching all the subjects through enhancing contact hours either in the same year or over years. That is in higher grades (over 3<sup>rd</sup> grades) disadvantaged children may spend more time to cover one year course of NCTB curriculum than to devote less time and fewer content to cover a grade (e.g., BNWLA spend 6 months to cover a grade). However, practical strategies have to be evolved through trial and error to resolve such problems through gradual introduction of more reliable and authorized curriculum for the purpose of education.

An effort was previously undertaken to develop standardized curricula for the children of non-formal schools, working children, out of school adolescents and even pre-primary school children by the former Directorate of Non Formal Education under the Ministry of Primary and Mass Education. This curriculum may be adopted for the organizations who provide education equivalent up to grade III. BRAC has developed curricula for their children who continue their education up to grade V. Along with these curricula appropriate primers were also developed for the respective courses. The curricula and materials are still available with the government and are more appropriate for the respective courses. Most of these materials were empirically tested and found useful for such disadvantaged children. Currently there is no curriculum available for the

non formal school children who would go beyond grade V. In this regard NCTB curriculum has to be followed until a new curriculum is developed. In case of NCTB curriculum all its components should be adopted without any omission and any content which is needed for the particular disadvantaged group may be added as supplementary reading. However, in order to reduce difficulty with NCTB curriculum total contact hour may be increased by one and half times either by lingering duration of course period or increasing school time per day.

The major shortcoming of the curriculum developed by any NGO is that they do not have any list of competencies that they desire to provide through their own education programme. NCTB has got a list of 50 competencies that are supposed to be learned by a child through his/her education up to grade five in primary school. If this curriculum is followed it should be continued with all the components until the grade level of five otherwise the achievement of the children will remain partial rather than complete. In order to use the NCTB curriculum for non formal school children a separate guideline has to be developed through workshop of concerned practitioners, experts and policy makers so that a national agreement is reached.

Curriculum with inclusiveness is a new coinage in the literature so it requires additional effort to prepare a valid and reliable one. At present no organization is rightly adopted a curriculum which is inclusive in its true sense. Children with diversified disadvantaged background like, *Behari* working children, domestic workers, and children involved in high risk profession, children from socially handicapped communities all are supposed to be involved in the SCSD NFE programme in a single group. But in reality except BPF no other organizations could be able to demonstrate inclusiveness in their education programme. Even in BPF only mentally retarded children study with the regular normal children in the same class but the other disadvantaged group like working or domestic or physically disabled children are not included in the BPF School.

The approach of non formal education in the SCSD programme is unique for its 'unitary inclusiveness' i.e., collectively inclusive but unit wise different. That is no organization is inclusive in terms of their educational provision. Each of the partner organizations deal with separate group of special need children instead of including all types of special need in one group. Therefore, the partners of SCSD need to be concerned about creating a school which is totally inclusive and non formal with all child rights interventions.

#### Learning materials: the primers

The organizations use different learning materials for their learners. Majority of the NGOs use the books developed by NCTB as basic primers. But along with this some supplementary reading materials like books, pamphlets, posters etc. on child rights, trafficking, child abuse etc., developed by various NGOs are used for the children. All the basic primers for learning of language start with sentences or words and then gradually break them down to

alphabets. This method is known as sentence based approach. Older children have been found to be benefited more with this system than the other conventional alphabet based method.

As most of the facilitators were educated by the conventional method they initially found the approach little difficult to use effectively. However, gradually they adopted with the system with whatever little training and under the supervision of the supervisor. In order to make the teaching more effective it would have been better if one type of primer could be utilized for a particular age group of children for all the organizations. SCSD may consider a unified type of curriculum and specific primers for their own funded programme instead of giving them liberty to use any materials.

Primers developed by NCTB are very much systematic and based on competencies which are needed to be achieved by the learners. Teachers working in formal primary school have the idea of those competencies and they try to reflect those competencies in their teaching learning exercises. In the absence of adequate training teachers in the NGO schools remain unconcerned about a very important component of teaching. Clear understanding of competency leads a teacher to achieve his or her goal but without such knowledge teacher's expectation becomes limited to rote information and change in inadequate behaviours only. Ultimately learning without comprehension becomes futile and learner gradually overlooks them while it becomes necessary to adopt. While teaching those NCTB books facilitators largely fail to focus on the competencies that are very much required for child development.

Books and primers developed by some NGOs have limited scope that is, those were developed by a small group of experts (or internally experienced personnel) and could not follow all the steps necessary for a valid and reliable text. For example some developed comprehensive books for one year (CPD) and other for several years (in three parts), as is done in Shaishob Banglades. The major shortcomings of those books are that they were not developed on the basis of any adequate scientific principle or spiral need of curriculum. Though to some extent vertical articulation was maintained but horizontally it could not be followed. Contents in the books seem to be quite exhaustive (and found overloaded in case of Shaishob Bangladesh and CPD) but their placement in chapters seems to be random. Text density varies from chapter to chapter but it is not sequentially arranged. Font size in the books is okay but the illustrations are not always clear. However, the other aspects of the texts like printing quality, binding, cover etc. are adequately maintained.

The primers used in CPD were developed by an individual effort and with a focus on child trafficking, sexual abuse and some other similar issues. These primers have several weaknesses, like it contains bigger sentences at the beginning, use of difficult concepts, poor and faulty syntax and conjunct words in early chapters. Though the weaknesses do not seem making a big difference to the learners' achievement yet their overall impact would create negative result when a child continues education in the mainstream school.

There is provision of supplementary readings for the children through the innovative approach of children's club. This club provides opportunity of extra reading, learning a vocational skills like music, art, cutting, knitting etc. through additional training. However, the opportunities are not available to all the children; only those who reside near to the club or willing to attend can avail the opportunity. So this provision is available to hardly 30 - 40 percent of the children only.

#### Teacher training: central to quality of education

Teacher training is central to the success of any education programme. It makes a teacher perfect to the extent of his/her classroom delivery and understanding of children's abilities. An incomplete training or insufficient preparation would not satisfy a person to be a good teacher. Non formal education sector is such a domain where preparation of teacher is always neglected. Instead teachers are expected to demonstrate their optimum skills with a limited and incomplete training. However, argument is given in favour of such inadequate training is that constant supervision and monthly daylong refresher training could supplement the inadequacy towards successful teaching. This argument needs to be substantiated through empirical evidences.

The non formal school teacher is vulnerable for his/her low profile qualification and poor sustainability in the system; for this reason he/she is neither considered appropriate for higher level training nor is taken as full time teacher for the school. Unlike most of the formal schools, teachers of non formal schools do not teach children with their pedagogical insights. That is every step of teaching is dictated and teachers are supposed to follow them. Therefore, in the regular practice these teachers become dependent on the teacher's guide and on supervisor's instruction. The supervisors also follow the teacher's guide in advising them to teach. In order to make the training effective NFE teacher training has to be long enough to contain all the necessary skills involved in teaching. But in this SCSD NFE programme all the teacher training suffers from many limitations. Within the project framework hardly any organization could provide suitable training to their teachers to teach children with greater efficiency. Most of the NGOs provided 3-6 day foundation training for their teachers with daylong refresher training per month. But monthly refreshers is not regular in almost all the organizations. It is needless to mention that no foundation training can be effective unless it contains some basic components like child psychology, methods of teaching, classroom management, preparation and use of teaching aids, techniques of learners' assessment, delivery of curriculum, etc. but it is not possible to cover all those with such a short time.

Another weakness of this training is that the foundation training is not provided by any recognized body of trainers following a standard syllabus. In two cases the training was given by the developer of primers clearly by emphasizing on the use of books and other reading materials. While classroom observation it appeared that such teachers are very weak in

delivery of content and involving learners in participatory learning. Learner assessment and questioning skill of the teachers also seem to be very conventional and prone to evaluate rote memory. A reflective teacher with a good training background surely would not follow such an approach.

As the teachers are poorly qualified their training should be rigorous and sufficiently prolonged to supplement the lack of formal education with any degree. Even teacher having university degrees were also found to follow the same mistakes as the school graduating teachers do. The apparent reasons may lie with the poorly designed training and in the lack of weak pedagogical background on the part of trainers.

#### Children's participation

Children's participation in various educational and managerial tasks though is desired in the programme yet it could not be achieved to a great extent. Every partner mentioned that they use children in various decision making work like developing curriculum, setting up routine and selecting classroom activities but in practice children's involvement is limited to attending meetings and giving their choices in class only. In case of NCTB curriculum there is limited/no scope of involving children in its development, but in case of organization based curriculum sometime children are consulted to determine contents, school time and co-curricular activities.

Children take part largely in children's club where they have scope to organize their own cultural and educational programme, give their choices to select books, and other reading materials etc. But in this case also elderly persons dominate the policy formulation and taking final decisions. The organization like BNWLA where children stay in the office premise take part more and more in the management and organizational activity. Children work in the office to help the management, take part in cooking in kitchen, clean their own belongings, also they help teacher to teach in lower classes. Such participation is good for the children for their future preparation. Children's active participation in policy matter and day to day office management is relatively low.

#### The classroom scenario

In order to call a learning centre 'a school' at least three components have to be present in the environment. These are teacher, student and a classroom. Of the three components the teacher and students are there but the classroom as it is generally conceived is not found in the learning centres under scrutiny. Out of nine NGOs except INCIDIN and SUF no one has a room can be suitably termed as classroom. These rooms are situated in the residence of a beneficiary or in a place where children can meet for study. Most of such place is very much inadequate for free learning. In this room children sit on mat cramped with difficulty. There is no space to move or play around for doing any learning exercise. In a small room like this teacher give

lecture while standing just in front of the students and face difficulty to reach a child if necessary. In a classroom like this the positions of chalkboard and teacher's face both remain high above the eye level that makes the children bent up their neck to see. Under such circumstances uninterrupted attention from children cannot be expected.

The whole teaching learning activity in the class is unidirectional i.e., teacher play the major role in the class. In every school teaching-learning exercise was teacher centered. There is a small chalk board in front of the class and few posters relevant to the situation of the children hang on the wall. Children spend two to three hours in school and mostly remain engaged in reading, writing and listening to lectures. Teachers' delivery in the class is very conventional i.e., reading, explaining and asking few questions. Writing exercises are also given to the children but in all cases rote learning is emphasized. Scope for creative writing and group work for better learning is limited due to space shortage. Teachers are also not well prepared to conduct such method in the classroom.

Use of teaching aid is very limited in the class. Creation of fun and joyful learning is present to some extent; in this regard teacher involves the children in play and reciting rhymes in between two classes. Children can play in class and draw with colour pencils etc. These co-curricular activities are limited to indoor activities only, outdoor activities are absent. The organizations provide less emphasis on these co-curricular aspects due to shortage of time and unavailability of materials in the school. However, children get some opportunity to play and perform other cultural activities in the club house but use of this club is also restricted to them for the shortage of space and time. All children are not equally able to attend the club due to distance from house and again they have to follow a weekly schedule to avail the opportunity.

#### Children's club: way to independence

Children's club is a new concept in the SCSD's education programme. The purpose of setting up this club is to provide children with learning experience of self dependence, managerial skills, sharing of knowledge and experience and finally to make them sustainable learner. It is an additional opportunity for the children to learn and perform as they like. The club is situated in a room in the office or in another rented house in the same community. There are provisions of reading facility, play indoor games, vocational and a vocational training. The club usually starts in the afternoon and remains open till evening. There is a small library with suitable books for children, and news paper to read. Children can borrow the books and read them. Such reading facility is helpful for creating confident and independent reader and vocational training makes the children ready for their future. A few children and adults outside the NFE programme also visit the club to satisfy their interest. However, the physical facility of the club is not good enough for large number of children in the locality.

There are only one or two clubs in the whole community of children in particular area in an organization. That is per 10-15 learning centres there is a club and children have weekly access to the club. Even the centres are fixed, all children of those centres can not attend the club due to time and distance constraints. Children who live nearby can avail the opportunity to a large extent. In this regard the children in BNWLA and INCIDIN are lucky because their club is in the same place (in the hostel and school building respectively) where they live but children in Shoishab Bangladesh cannot attend the distant club due to time constraints. These domestic workers have very little time to spend for their own. Thus children in Shoishab Bangladesh mostly are unable to attend the club.

There are some training opportunities for the children in the club such as dress making, cooking and making handicrafts. Other than these training there are opportunities to learn music and dance for the children. Children learn to perform through this club and make them smarter. However, it was observed that the club organizers have limitation in dealing with all these skills so it would have been better if part time or outside experts are kept attached to it for teaching the children in free time.

#### Mainstreaming the children's education: a biggest challenge

Mainstreaming is the alternative approach of schooling of those children who failed to attend school in due time for various reasons and now brought back to school after attending a non-formal education centre up to certain level. These children are older by age and some are larger in size compared to the regular children in school. Several of the NGOs have succeeded in getting more and more children into government schools on completion of grade III in the NFE centre. This mainstreaming has been achieved through motivation of the parents and advocating with the formal school authority. Some of them have succeeded in getting the admission fees reduced in their local areas and in some local schools even the school timing was changed. The compulsory primary education act of 1993 has to some extent changed the approach of the authorities towards NGO involvement in education. Some of them respond to the needs of children who are normally excluded from schools i.e., children with disabilities, children working on the streets, children living in slums, there is still scope for reaching more hard-to-reach working children and the hardcore urban poor.

Organizations that mainstream children from NFE centres into government schools follow them for a few months only to monitor their retention and progress. NGO workers are also focusing on building relationships with teachers of these schools and other influential persons for obtaining better service for the mainstreamed children. However, no NGO has any data of children who could have been graduated from any primary or high school having NFE background.

The success of mainstreaming is found limited to some group of children than the others. Particularly children who are never enrolled or dropped out from schools are easy to mainstream than the working, abused or disabled children. Discussion with partner organizations shows that large number of children from Uddipan, SEEP, CPD and SUF could be enrolled in the regular schools. The children who are younger in age and close to the school going cohort are easily accepted by the school than the older children. There is a big gap in the culture of NFE and formal school what creates the major challenge for these mainstreamed children to sustain. Often the children who receive greater attention in the NFE centre are neglected in the formal school by teachers and also they feel less important by discovering them in larger group. The NFE graduates go through a curriculum which is either adapted to their needs or simplified to fit their intellect, therefore, when they go to mainstream schools and fell in less supportive environment they begin to loose interest in education. Along with this situation when teacher's hard-line action is added to the situation or poor achievement results in examination then the tendency of dropping out from school again reappears and the student become vulnerable and subsequently degenerated from the school.

The mainstream schools are different from the non formal schools in terms of student quality, number of students in a class, teaching learning exercise, curriculum, duration of school hour etc. So the children coming from non formal school has to face a culture shock in the regular school. On the other hand teachers and students in formal school do not have any idea about vulnerability of the NFE children so they treat them either equally with the regular group of children or consider them weak and disrespectful in the class. So the teachers and students need some orientation prior to enrolling any NFE graduate in the school.

The working children largely belong to the hard-to-reach category; teaching these children demands extra provisions in the system and involvement of additional cliental group like employers, community leaders etc. Such demands are met in the project by making the school time flexible, creating space for employers for advocacy. Enrolling community leaders in this education programme and developing child friendly curriculum for these groups is a big challenge. All the above changes were made in the programme and they brought about positive changes in learners achievement, attendance and dropout. It has been reported by the concerned NGOs (Shoishab, CPD, SUF, INCIDIN etc.) that the employers who are directly involved with the organization through their child workers are now very supportive and endorse the importance of child rights and try to maintain them through their day to day acts.

Large number of children study in this programmes are interested to continue their education after completing non formal education in the centre. But gradually it becomes difficult for them to continue in the regular school for the above mentioned reasons. So in order to continue their education in the formal school there should have separate approach of higher education with all the non formal facilities in the school.

#### Individual Partners' Assessment

#### 1. BNWLA

Bangladesh National Women Lawyers Association (BNWLA) was formed in 1979 with a vision to support the destitute women and children in the legal matters. With this vision they stated education programme in 1993 with the financial support from SCSD. BNWLA's education programme is unique in its nature and largely supports the most vulnerable and exclusively marginalized women and children e.g., sexually abused, socially deserted and repatriated children. Prior to beginning the education programme BNWLA conducted a survey among their beneficiaries and finally depending upon their need they established a school in their office.

The age group of these children ranges between 5 and 17. Both male and female children are served here with the emphasis on girls. The school has 110 students of which mostly are girls (16 are boys). Their provision of education is more formal (based on NCTB curriculum) in nature than the non formal. They provide education up to grade V and then mainstream them in the nearby high schools. The approach of teaching, timing, delivery of education is non formal in nature. The main objective of their education programme is to keep the children engaged while they are in shelter home and educate themselves to a sustainable level.

#### **Major activities**

Major activities of BNWLA include rescuing the destitute women and girls from brothel, trafficking, sexually abused or socially deserted and repatriated children. After rescuing the children or women they are given shelter and education prior to their rehabilitation.

#### Status of the school

The only school of BNWLA is unique of its kind run in three shifts. The first shift of the school largely deals with the children of pre-primary and primary age group. Among these children many are lost kids, camel jockey boys and some raped girls. Their age ranges between five and 10. The second shift school is meant for the young adolescents who are mostly the victims of sexual harassment and violence. Many of these girls are rescued from other countries and brothel. The third shift run with the older adolescents where the teacher student interacts is more or less individualized instead of conventional classroom situation. This shift is meant for the working adolescents and hence they do not have any fixed time. Depending upon the availability of time the working girls come to the school and sit with the teacher for study.

The school is very much inclusive in terms of the quality of the students because, varieties of children including abandoned children, rescued sex workers, trafficking child, emotionally disturbed and socially handicapped type of children are enrolled in this school. The school does not include any physical or mentally retarded children for lack of expertise in dealing them. There are six regular teachers in the school along with some volunteer teachers. All the teachers are college graduate with general education having graduation and master's degree but except one none of them have any professional degree (certificate in teaching or bachelor of education course). All the teachers are found very sympathetic and friendly to the children and there are some peer group tutor as well (ie., senior students who are used to teach in the lower grades).

The BNWLA school is located in a hired multi storied house which has all the good features like airy and spacious room, sufficient space to move, sitting provisions etc. The school also has very good hostel for the children to reside and improved food to maintain their health. But due to obvious reason the school do not possess any play ground or open space outside the building. The girls are not also allowed to go outside the building for any reason. However, they are taken out to visit place of interest and fun fairs in a group under teachers' supervision. Important facilities like safe drinking water, toilets, library etc. are also available in the school.

# **Quality of education**

In order to maintain the quality of education BNWLA uses the national curriculum for their primary level education along with some other curriculum developed by BRAC and Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM). In this regard they use the eclectic approach of curriculum to fit their situation best. The education in the school is unique and substantially fluctuates among the curriculums. As the learners are psychologically disturbed and are heavily loaded with their past, the teachers mostly adopt therapeutic and humanistic approach in teaching rather than teaching in conventional ways. And for that uniqueness the school cannot follow the academic year along with prescribed syllabi. Children are largely encouraged to read extra reading materials in library and engaged in games and play in their leisure time. Other learning materials like posters, charts and learning blocks are available with the school but teachers have limited scope to use them. All boys and girls are encouraged to attend music, dance and drama classes regularly which are very useful component in their process of education. Children also develop their own reading materials like wall magazine and newsletter.

Classroom observation demonstrates a very simple and conventional practice of teaching in the school. Teacher sits with few children (ranging from 3-10) in a group either in the floor or in a table. Children study some content in group or go by their own pace through different lessons and teacher facilitate them in learning through various means like instruction, dictation, explanation etc. Such teaching strategy conventionally provides individualized teaching and effective learner friendly environment. Demonstration of events or use of

audio-visual teaching aids is less frequent in these classes; however, it seemed that teacher uses lot of verbal means like describing, story telling, citing examples and explaining replaces the needs of materials in the class.

Since the teacher provides individualized teaching, assessment is quite simple and continuous. As the students progress teacher develops clear understanding about their achievement and progress. Teachers take it granted for evaluating the students' promotion to other grades though regular monthly and annual examinations are considered for the same purpose as well. While having group discussion with teacher they mentioned that the purpose of examination is not to promote or retain them in classes rather it is to bring confidence and self-esteem in children's educational development.

It is very interesting to note that almost all children attend classes regularly. It was reported that about 95% children remain present in the class everyday. Those who do not attend class have health or emotional reasons. Teachers handle the issue of absenteeism with more emotional attachment than administrative rules. Children however, reported that teachers sometime use scolding and hitting though its incidence is very low.

#### Learner participation

Learner participation in the whole education process is a part of the BNWLA's strategy of bringing change in the behaviour of the children. From the very beginning of schooling in shelter home children are brought up in house families. Approximately 15-20 children live in house under a house mother who takes care of her children in day to day life. A house mother is women of middle age with moderate school or college education. They are permanent resident of the shelter home and play the role of mother for the destitute children. Both in house and school children are allowed to take part in many decisions making like selection of study materials, vocational class, formation of house rules and teaching and assisting younger kids. Children also take part in vocational and cultural activities which they organize and perform. Children's participation in other activities, particularly in household work, peer tutoring and rearing younger kids is very common in the school. Such participation is very helpful for child development.

#### Monitoring & supervision

As the shelter home is located at the head office of BNWLA it is easier to monitor the progress of the project. There is a coordinator of education project who frequently supervises the teaching-learning activities in the shelter home. Moreover, the coordinator provides a monthly status report to the Programme Manager which helps to monitor the activities up to satisfactory level.

#### **Community involvement**

In the case of BNWLA's shelter home it is very much isolated where community has no contact with the children or the teachers as such. It was mentioned by the authority that for the sake of security and avoiding embarrassment of children the community association is carefully avoided.

#### 2. CPD

Community Participation and Development (CPD) was established in 1993 by a group of local social worker with a view of uplift the social and economic conditions of distressed women and children of different areas of Bangladesh. It has a clear mission statement undertaking intensive and extensive programmes for the distressed people to bring a positive change in their lives. It has been working with the disadvantaged people particularly with children and women since its inception period. CPD has also a good working relation with target beneficiaries, parents/guardians, community people, government agencies and community-based organization in the working area. The organization is experienced in gathering information and has skilled and committed manpower. CPD has also good networking with local NGOs and other programme related forums or associations operating in its working area.

Mostly adolescent boys and girls are enrolled in CPD schools. The male female ration is 40:60. Their provision of education is more non formal in nature and children spend three hours a day in the school room. Through their educational approach they provide education equivalent up to grade III and then mainstream them in the nearby primary schools. The main objective of their education programme is to bring the working children back to school and provide them with the skills of lifelong education and some vocational skills for wage earning activities.

#### Major activities

The CPD is very much involved with the disadvantaged adolescents and their development. They have non formal education programme for the adolescents, awareness raising programme on child rights, income generation training, saving & credit programme, health and family planning, advocacy with school teachers and employers, child trafficking and preschool education for the children. CPD is working in greater Mohammadpur area with distressed women and adolescents in Geneva Camp. Presently it has expanded its programme in Chattak of Sylhet and five-border areas of Rangpur and Dinajpur districts.

#### The NFE programme and target group

CPD runs NFE programme for adolescents for one year targeting competency level up to grade III of formal school. This is a centre based non formal education approach run through three centers in two shifts. There are 120 adolescents of which 60% are girls. CPD initially started their education programme with Dhaka Ahsania Mission's curriculum and primers. This programme included literacy, vocational training, income generation and other advocacy issues. After 2002 they changed their curriculum and adopted a new one from Child Labour Prostitution & Trafficking Programme (CLPTP) where major emphasis is on child right, child trafficking and literacy.

#### Status of the school

The schools are located in Mohammadpur Geneva camp and slum areas so that children and adolescents from these areas can attend schools. The schools are nothing but a rented room in a residential house. The size of each school is approximately 10 by 12 feet and have mat to sit on. The room is too little for 20 students to sit, move and study. There is a medium size chalk board to write and several posters related to education, child trafficking and child rights hang on the wall. Unfortunately the schools do not have any other facility like play ground, separate toilets, drinking water facility etc.

The first shift school run for two and half hours in the morning and the second shift starts in the afternoon for the same period. The teacher student ration in the school is ideal i.e., 1:20. The students' age ranges between 10 and 17. All the students are working adolescents and live nearby.

Every school or learning centre has a managing committee comprising of local interested persons. The school runs for six days a week all the working days in a month except the national holidays. Learners' attendance in school seems to be satisfactory i.e., about 90% of them remain present in every working day.

#### Quality of education

The factors that are responsible for quality education is not adequately present in the schools. If we start with the physical environment we find it to be insufficient in terms of space and materials. Children sit cramped position and have little space to move and put their books and writing materials. Teachers have few materials to demonstrate and use as teaching aids.

Teaching is very much conventional and passive for the learners. The authority provided a flip chart on the book which is enlarged photocopy of each page to demonstrate lesson to the larger group. The print out is not very clear and distinct. Students recite, memorize and write for permanent learning. The teachers received three day training on CLPTP materials. Other then this CPD provides one day refresher training per month where they

discuss about instructional strategy for the next one month. In order to provide quality education there is no alternative to sufficiently qualified and trained teacher. In this case most of the teachers are qualified but have no pedagogical training. Teachers use their common sense, knowledge and wit in case of teaching.

The non formal education, in principle, uses the technique of participatory approaches of teaching and learning but in this case it is loaded with teacher centered strategies. In this case teacher provides direct instruction, dictates and leads the children for learning. However, teacher some time uses peer group discussion and group work for effective teaching, but in the absence of space and good training these activities could not be potentially utilized. There are some games which are aimed to develop certain competencies in children but those ones are also inadequately performed in the absence of time and space. Children have very little time to draw and sing in the whole week.

#### **Curriculum and teaching learning activities**

The CPD has a small education team who look after the whole process. Their education has borrowed a curriculum form CLPTP which is focused to some specific objectives. In order to be a NFE curriculum it has some gaps which are not addressed in the school. Pedagogically the primer and curriculum is weak. They follow a weekly and monthly target to prepare the lesson plan designed in the CLPTP curriculum. There is a mechanism of maintaining daily lesson plan in the classroom. CPD follow CLPTP curriculum as well as adopt some child friendly co curricular activities. Children have scopes to involve in extra curricular activities. Weak learners can stay over for some additional times after the class. During this time they can get support from the peer groups. CPD discusses child rights issues in the class as well as in the parents meeting. There is no specific manual to discuss child rights issues. CPDD provide lodgings, education, and skill trainings to these children. They also support with teaching aids.

#### Student achievement and their participation in programme

Student achievement in general is visible through terminal and yearly examination i.e., they can read and write within a year. According to the teachers report large majority of the students pass in the examination. There are a few children who do poorly in exam but teachers help them to overcome with their problems. However, these poor achievers unlike their bright peers do not continue (or want to continue) study in the formal school. The teacher mentioned that less than half of their children get admission in the formal primary school. Besides literacy, children receive skill training, income generating activities and other right based trainings. The best achievement among the children is the development of reading habit and cooperative learning through children's club.

Children take part in educational planning to some extent i.e., they decide the schedule of content for next quarter and other activities like games,

observance of national days and cultural programmes. Otherwise, CPD has no clear strategy on children's participation. Advanced learners are utilized to support the learning of slow learners in the class. There is no involvement of children in the formation of academic curriculum or academic calendar.

#### Issue of inclusion and child rights

All the staff and teachers received training on CRC and try to follow that in their classes and other activities. Punishment or pressure is not given to the children for any reason. Children, parents and their employers regularly receive orientation and information on child rights and their safety. In case of any violation of child right CPD workers take immediate action to overcome them. Besides the CRC inclusion is not followed by its definition. Only a few students (not more than 5%) have some kind of disability (physically impaired) while other kinds of impairment like of social or culturally disadvantaged children are not enrolled. Like other organizations CPD organizers also feel that inclusion in its true sense is not possible because of the absence of training or expertise to handle them, however, they believe that they deal with a group which is excluded from any other school for their disadvantageous nature.

#### Teacher training and their performance

Teacher training is largely provided by the senior staff of the organization. There is no inherent training programme for teachers and staff in CPD. They received only a three day short training on interactive teaching from an external source and they provide a refreshers training a day per month which obviously is not sufficient for the purpose. However, teachers received training on gender awareness, CR, communication, teaching style etc. from various partner organizations.

#### **Community participation**

The CPD has good contact with the local community and has created a good image as education provider to their children. There is a committee called centre management committee comprised of a teacher, two children, two parents and two local leaders who occasionally meet to discuss about the educational problems in the school. While discussing with parent it appeared to the investigator that they are happy with the school programme and always willing to support the school by their physical labour and moral support.

#### 3. SEEP

The SEEP (Social & Economic Enhancement Program) was established by a group of social workers in 1985. Its mission is to work for the children of disadvantaged community like *Behari* people working in *benarasi* factories. The intention of the organization is to empower and involve the disadvantaged children, as well as those of their parents and community so that they can protect and promote child rights. The target beneficiaries of the project are the children live in *Behari* camp and involve in benarasi saree factories, karchupi jori and embroidery works. The target groups are parents, employers and community people. The main activities are non formal education, awareness raising, child club, credit support to parents and networking children.

The main objective of their programme is to provide education to the *Behari* working and mainstream them in possible cases. Mostly adolescent boys and girls are enrolled in CPD schools for three years. Within this school years they are supposed to achieve education up to fifth grade in formal primary school. The male female ratio is 40:60. Their education is non formal in nature and children spend three hours a day in the school room. After receiving education in SEEP school some capable children go to nearby primary or high school depending upon their achievement.

#### **Major activities**

Among their activities they run primary education for the working children, advocacy programme, awareness raising and micro credit for the parents of the children. Their objectives are to provide education to child labours, non formal primary education, vocational training, advocacy and social mobilization, provide health care and education children and their families and finally empower children and their families by providing micro credits.

#### The NFE programme and target group

The organization works in Mirpur area in Dhaka city with the working children of *Behari* families mostly work in benarasi factories. Large number of children and young adolescents work in these factories but they do not have any formal or non formal education though which they can improve their quality of life. SEEP largely intends to provide education to these young people so that they become aware of their rights, understand the importance of education and enhance their quality of life.

Education is provided through 10 non formal schools situated in *Behari* camp at Mirpur, Dhaka. Other than the school they have children club to facilitate their learning and conduct advocacy programme in favour of child rights and awareness building activities. Micro-credit also provides a good incentive for the family to send their children to school.

#### Status of the school

One of the basic components of quality education is the school house itself but in this regard SEEP schools largely fail to provide necessary facilities of being a school house. None of the schools have necessary space for the children to move in the class, no courtyard or play ground adjacent or nearby for physical exercise/activity of the children, no source of safe drinking water or toilets for the teacher or students and no materials to play with. Classroom is poorly equipped with a chalkboard and some posters and charts for the teacher's occasional use. Other teaching aids or varieties of learning materials are not adequately available in the school.

There are 300 students in 10 slum dueling schools. Though the number of boys and girls in the schools are close to half yet girls outnumber the boys. Their age ranges between 10 and 15. Most of the children enrolled in school are working in *benarosi saree* factories with typical hazardous work (fixing jari or chumki in benarosi sarees), which is injurious for children's eyesight.

Several concerns of quality are incorporated in the three year schooling of SEEP. That is teacher student ratio is very much ideal (i.e., 1:30). This ratio is manageable for the teacher and children have the scope to receive greater attention from the teacher. Though the school adopts a non formal strategy for teaching learning activities yet the curriculum chosen for the purpose is the national curriculum developed for the formal school children in general. That reduces the effectiveness of learning and overall school performance.

Children sit in floor in rows living no room for teacher to pass through. Even it is harder for children to write on note book as there is little space in front. Though the schools have an electric fan and light yet cross ventilation is very limited to supply fresh air in the room. Few supplied posters (containing various messages) hang on the wall but their use seems to be limited.

#### Quality of education

The school starts at 7:30 in the morning with national anthem and continues up to 10:30. During this time children learn various subjects given in the curriculum. The class schedule is a flexible one and teacher engaged in teaching subjects depending upon the learners' choice. Most of the teachers possess college degree and higher education which is highly appreciating but their training level seems to be very much inadequate. Teacher demonstrates the lesson and students learn them by heart. Rote memorization and recitation receives the priority in teaching learning activity. However, the teachers are very friendly and active in the classroom. In the absence of appropriate training the classroom turns into a traditional place where teacher seems to be more active than the learners.

Over a period of three years now the children can read and write and can perform the addition and subtraction with some difficulties. The children speak

Urdu or *Behari* language at home but that does not hamper their education in the classroom. During my classroom observation majority of the students were found seriously engaged in learning even though there were mistakes and challenges in comprehensions. Teacher mentioned that there are monthly and annual examinations but no students are retained in the previous class; in case of poor performers teacher coach them with additional care.

In order to make the class attractive teacher sometime make use of various games and participatory teaching and learning approaches this is not sufficient for enhancing learners' comprehension.

# **Curriculum and teaching learning activities**

SEEP conducts three years education for the *Behari* working children mostly engaged in weaving industry. They use government curriculum as well as books developed by NCTB for grades I to III. Along with these books there are quite a good number of supplementary reading books are used for children's education. These books are available in the children's club. According to the report of the teacher and students children like to attend the club and borrow books of their own interest. Other than reading books children also take part in many social and national events to enhance their knowledge.

Teacher develops a plan for a month which they call lesson plan in the school. This plan contains the topics to be taught and the activities and games to be used in the respective weeks and days. Within the period of three hours in school teacher teach Bangla, Maths, English and Environmental Study. Teachers receive all the teaching instructions in the monthly refresher training. Such lesson plans are not pedagogically sound because of their poor theoretical background.

There is no special mechanism to support the weak learners but they sometime stay back after the class hour to receive additional coaching. Children do not receive any educational support from the family as they are mostly illiterate and remain busy with their earning and household work. Therefore school has to provide all the teaching support during school hours. They have little home work and home based assignments which needs parental support. Students learn to read, write and count in the school.

Day to day classroom activities seems to be participatory i.e., teacher select subjects to be taught in the class on the basis of children's choice. Here the teaching is largely conventional and rote. Students memorize the content and recite and write. There are some games for the children in class which may facilitate their life skills and morale. However, it is a question that how far the curriculum for the privileged group (the formal school children) is useful for the underprivileged children.

#### Student achievement and their participation in programme

Student achievement in the school is measured through terminal examinations and day to day class performance. There are monthly and yearly examination, students need to sit for those examinations mostly in conventional ways. Though there is examination system yet none of the students are retained in the same class for failing in exam. Those who do poorly in the examination they are coached additionally to overcome their difficulties. Teacher and programme coordinator mentioned in their interviews that nearly 80% to 90% of the students passing out from the school get enrolled in the mainstream school but due to poverty and higher age they dropped out from the school in short intervals.

Child participation in SEEP's education programme is limited to learner activities. Fewer children are involved in the organizational planning and management. They have very little role in determining course curriculum, daily schedule and annual activities. However, in children's club they take part in organizing some activities. SEEP has no clear strategy on children's participation in the curriculum development and other academic activities. Teaching style is traditional or teacher centered so, children's participation is not encouraged except some group activities. Advanced learners help the low achievers through peer learning system in the classroom. There is no fixed target for the competency achievement for the students. Children participate in cultural activities (eg. street theatre, mime shows) and in community-based variety shows (child rights issues to mobilize the opinion of the community, child labour etc.).

#### Issue of inclusion and child rights

Child right issue is a big concern in the SEEP programme. All the staff and teachers received training on CRC and try to follow that in their classes and other activities. Students are not punished or pressurized for any reason. Children, parents and their employers regularly receive orientation and information on child rights and their safety. In case of any violation of child rights SEEP workers take immediate action to overcome them. Besides the CRC inclusion is not followed by its definition. No disabled child is enrolled in class nor a mixture of children from other community found in class. SEEP organizers feel that inclusion in its true sense is not possible because of the absence of training or expertise to handle them; however, they believe that they deal with a group which is excluded from any other school for their disadvantageous nature.

#### Teacher training and their performance

Teachers receive 4 days training per year plus one day refresher per month from the organizers. On the other hand, they also received training on gender awareness, CR, communication, teaching style etc. Besides that they have 3-5 days foundation training on teaching from the organization. This training is

the weakest side of the organization because it cannot provide clear picture on child development, child psychology, and curriculum or classroom management. They received an 8-day training spread over one year on interactive teaching from an international English medium school in Dhaka (ISD). It is questionable that how a training of 8 days spread over one year can be effective for any trainee.

#### **Community participation**

Involvement of community in the programme is one of the important components in SEEP. There is a project facilitating group as well as teachers who contact with parents for any important issue. For any community initiatives and problem SEEP gets help from this group. In designing process of the project parents had little involvement but in latter stages community is largely consulted. When community is referred it means mostly parents and sometime the employers. Few other local leaders are also involved. Parents have trust on the workers for their children's education. Though it is conceived that parents would monitor and supervise the education activity but it is not largely maintained. Through this meeting parents are made aware about the performance of the children and theirs responsibility towards children. Parents do not have any monetary contribution to the project activities.

#### 4. SUF

The society of underprivileged Families (SUF) was established in 1988 with a vision to serve disadvantaged people of the society. The main objectives of the organization are to protect and promote child and human rights, eradicate illiteracy, establish justice and to enhance the latent capacities of the marginal women and men through socioeconomic empowerment. SUF is active members of many renowned networks working for promotion of human rights like Bangladesh Shishu Adhikar Forum, Child Labour Prostitution and Trafficking Programme.

SUF provides education to 8 to 14 year old children majority of whom are working in the surrounding areas. It runs non formal school in the afternoon in two shifts in densely populated area of Dhaka city. Purpose of this schooling for the school dropouts and working children is to provide them second chance for education. Children can study there for four years up to grade VIII. That is each grade is covered in six months time.

#### **Major activities**

Since 1999 SUF embarks on child rights programme and since 2001, it has been engaged in non-formal education with the working children aged between 8 and 14 years under its basic education for hard to reach urban working children project. The main activities are non formal education, skills training, awareness on child right, child club, credit support, job placement and networking. Moreover, staff capacity building is also and important activity for proper and smooth implementation of the project. The activities are implemented in three wards of Dhaka city.

# NFE programme and target group

The education programme of SUF starts from grade one and continue up to grades VIII. Each grade lasts for six month with an adapted version of NCTB curriculum. From NCTB curriculum they accepted only four subjects like, Bangla, Mathematics, English and Social Studies. About 70% of the curriculum are retained same and remaining 30% are replaced with contents of child rights, child trafficking, working environment etc. The additional contents are taught through supplementary reading materials.

The targeted children are identified through a previous survey in the locality and working children with hazardous job are identified for the schooling. Other than these working groups disabled or social handicapped children are not included in the programme. Prior to enrolling the children parents and employers meetings are convened to convince them in favour of children's education.

#### Status of school

There are 16 teachers for two schools of which 12 are female. The school runs for two hours in the afternoon for five days a week. The class size is 35 per teacher. The present enrollment is 757 children of whom girls and boys ratio are 60% and 40% respectively. NFE completion rate is 87%, of whom 90% are girls and 85% are boys. Drop out rate per NFE centre is about two percent. Girls' dropout rate is less than the boys.

#### Quality of education

The school is a four story building in a densely populated area. The organization owns the building and run schools in its different specious rooms. The classrooms are conventionally arranged have benches and tools for the students. There is a chalk board in front. Teaching is traditionally i.e., teacher centred and rote learning based but the environment is very child friendly because teacher rarely become harsh with the children and do not beat them. Use of teaching aids in the classroom is very low, other than books teacher hardly use any object to demonstrate. Teaching time for each class is also

limited to 30/35 minutes. Children seem to comprehend learning materials by rote memory. Memorization is still dominant in the class. Teacher do not have any exposure to any modern method so they are confined to lecture and discussions only.

Total contact hour per week is only 10 which is very low for a group of first generation learner. Other than this time children do not have their own study time at home or in the working place. Though the responding students mentioned that they study at home but it is easily understood that how quality time they do have to finish their study. However, it is observed children use this little time for their learning and learn to pass the examination. Perhaps their older age may have some effect on their learning despite the low contact hours.

### **Curriculum and teaching learning activities**

SUF adapted the NCTB curriculum for their education programme. This was done with a view to enable the SUF graduates to mainstream in the formal school. According to the report of the SUF staff they organize meetings to modify the NCTB curriculum to fit into their own setup. In the modification process they involve teachers, parents, and students. Contents which are not directly related to the life of the children are replaced by more life oriented and child right contents. Along with curriculum this organization also adopted the NCTB primers as well. However, supplementary reading materials are used to cover the replaced contents. Other than reading materials discussion, seminars group meeting are used to disseminate various educational information to the children.

Children club is one of the vital sources of information and behaviour modification for the children other than the schools' teaching learning activity. Purpose of this club is to provide children with additional reading facility, grow leadership and provide vocational training for their future development. A good number of the students used to attend children's club where they have the opportunity to read and borrow books of their own interest, listen to lectures on various contemporary issues and spend leisure time through play and other activities. Though it is meant for the children yet organization staff supervises the activity and help children to manage the club. It is reported that majority of the enrolled children along with other local people visit children club regularly. This club has books, papers, play materials and other educational activities to provide learning opportunities for children. As the club space is limited and the club and children ratio is large, a significant number of children cannot get the real benefit out of this club.

### Student achievement and their participation in programme

According to the report of the teacher large majority of the students pass in the exam. Those who fail in exam receive additional coaching and are promoted to higher classes. Children can read, write and count efficiently within first three grades in 18 months only, and then they go on with additional contents like social science, science and literature. Their reading ability helps them to learn more on other relevant issues from their supplementary readings.

### Issue of inclusion and child right

The meaning of inclusion to SUF people is simple; in this regard they consider all types of working children who are vulnerable and prone to life risk in their working place. As a matter of chance SUF schools enrolled 2-3 physically disabled children in their school. But the inclusion is not a concerted effort in the programme.

### Teacher training and their performance

Like other organizations SUF teachers face similar problem with training on teaching. They have only 10 day's foundation training. This training contains the issues of teaching, classroom management, use of curriculum, and largely contains the aspect of child rights, hazardous work, environment and child trafficking. Apparently the training is too little for the requirement.

# **Community participation**

The SUF maintains good contact with local community people and has created a good image as education provider to their children. There is a committee called watch group comprised of a teacher, employer and other community leaders. Children are also included in this group to make it more participatory. The group occasionally meets to discuss about the educational problems in the school and support the children in case of any difficulty arises from their employer's side or any other issue. While having discussion with parent and employer it appeared to the investigator that they are happy with the school programme and always willing to support the school by their physical labour and moral support.

#### 5. INCIDIN

INCIDIN was established in 1994 with objectives of doing research and advocacy for the children who are working as an alternative to their study and also to address the trafficking issue in the community. In its community development effort it provides children with education and health care who are working in benerashi sharee factories without hampering their opportunity of acquiring traditional weaving skills. They started a non formal basic education

and health care programme in 2002 for the Behari children with the financial assistance from SCSD. The overall objective of the project is the reduction of hazardous child labour and save them from any kind of trafficking and violence.

INCIDIN runs education for children and adolescents from grade I to VIII in 8 years. The approach of education is formal but timing is flexible i.e., only two hours per day. The major objective of their education programme is to provide second option for the children to educate them and make it sustainable for further development.

# **Major activities**

INCIDIN Bangladesh believes in sustainable development through peoples' empowerment and emancipation both at economic and political spheres. They emphasize in participation and ownership of people. INCIDIN is not a mere tool but organization of establishing, ensuring, and importantly, entertaining emancipation. In its community development efforts it provides children with quality education and health care who are engaged in the benarasi saree factories without hampering their opportunity of acquiring traditional weaving skills. At the same time, INCIDIN is maintaining continual efforts to deal with the problems of trafficking and sexual exploitation of children through psychological counseling, capacity building and networking.

#### Status of school and quality of education

The non formal education programme of the organization started from 2000. They provide education to children a NFE school at Mirpur at the working site of the children. The school has eight classes, grade I through VIII. There are over 300 students in the school of which 50% are girls. Their age ranges between 8 and 18. The school is situated in a rented multistoried building. The classrooms are filled with benches for about 30 students each. The room space is just enough for those students but not sufficient for them to move and work around. Every room has a fan and sufficient light facility. There are 7 teachers of whom mostly are graduate but except one none have any formal training (degree) on education.

The school has two shifts one starts in the morning and the other in the afternoon, both continue for two hours only. The same group of teacher takes the classes. As the children's mother tongue is Urdu they learn this language as one of their basic subject. Moreover, the teachers are also taken from the *Behari* community so that in case of necessity content can be explained in that language. The school teaches only four subjects — Bangla, English, Mathematics and Social Studies.

Other then the basic subjects students have opportunity to learn songs and drawings. They have some other outing programmes as well as they observe all the national days in the school. Teaching learning exercise in the school is

traditional and rote by nature. Teachers hardly use any teaching aids in the class and there is little scope of using interactive method of teaching in the class due to shortage of space. During classroom observation children were found to do some free hand exercise in the class standing cramped between benches.

The assessment system in the class is conventional; students have terminal examination and periodical exams. However, the exams are mostly essay type and deals with the students' cognitive based knowledge only. There is no provision of continuous evaluation rather teachers have some subjective knowledge about the students and that help teachers to assess a learner for his/her overall development.

### Curriculum and teaching learning activities

The curriculum used in the school is different for different grades, such as up to grade III INCIDIN uses BRAC curriculum and from grades IV they use NCTB curriculum. And again the whole curriculum is not used rather they adapt it to their needs. The basic primers also correspond to the respective curricula. The change in curricula is made by teachers through meeting depending upon their own experience. Such method of adaptation of curriculum may not be appropriate for achieving the goal. According to their version curriculum do not contain any set of objectives or competencies which the children must acquire. There is no list of co-curricular activities. Children have the opportunity to use lot of supplementary learning materials through the children's club which is situated in the same building. This club contains two book shelves and a table which is not sufficient for the children. The size of the club room is not sufficiently large for large group of children, so they come and take away their chosen books and study at home.

As extra curricular activities INCIDIN School have various cultural and sports programmes. They have inter school sports competition and some selected children also took part in national programme and visited foreign countries as a member of national delegate.

# Issues of inclusion and child rights

The school does not have any Inclusive programme but they mentioned that there are some children who have learning disability. Otherwise it is not possible to have any disabled children in their school because they do not have any training on the subject. The school enrolls largely the poor Behari working children who could not attend primary school due to financial constraints or the children who dropped from school for the same reason. This community of children is special in nature and they have no place to go and for their special working nature they are unable to attend the mainstream school as well. So this approach of NFE suits them very well and they can attend the school.

Child rights are addressed through various training and class lectures. Children attend meetings and seminars in the children's club. They borrow from the club to learn about national issues and other relevant subjects. The school conducts parents' and employers' meeting where the issue is largely discussed and proper measures are taken to resolve the problems should they rise.

### Teacher training and their performance

The teachers initially received the basic training from BRAC for 15 days. Other than this training teachers do not have any exposure to professional support. This training dealt with many issues like classroom management, dissemination of curriculum, teaching method, child psychology, assessment and evaluation etc. however, this is not sufficient for a group of teachers who have low profile general education. The training may be called orientation rather a full-fledged teacher training. The supervisor of the school has higher degree in education i.e., she obtained an M. Ed and tries to lead the teachers accordingly in class. The teachers meet every day between the school hours and finish the pertinent job like preparing questions for examination, seeing home task and discuss any relevant issue whenever necessary. They have refresher training once a month but that is not sufficient both in terms of training coverage and time.

### **Community participation**

The organization has good contact with local community people and has created a good image as education provider to their children. There is a committee called centre management committee who look after the school's various activities as part of follow-up mechanism. INCIDIN arranges meeting with parents and employers after every 15 days and with community leaders in a month. The meeting discusses various educational, health, child rights and other social problems. The committee also includes some children for the sake of their participation. It is reported that local community are happy with the organizational effort and there is a pressure from their side to enroll more children in the school or establish more schools in the community for the never enrolled children.

#### 6. SHOISHAB BANGLADESH

Shoishab Bangladeh started its activities as a nonprofit, non-government organization in 1991, working with socially disadvantaged children and working women. Shoishab pioneered the activities with street children in Dhaka and expanded into areas of child domestic workers. The organization

has no country pogramme strategy on education. There is a project implementation strategy. Shoishab Bangladesh doses not have any separate education strategy. Education and social awareness is considered as the main focus of the organization.

Shoishab Bangladesh runs 30 learning centres in Dhaka city each contains 20 learners of which 80% are boys and 20% are girls. Age of these children ranges between 12 and 18 years. They study for three years in the centre and by the end of that time they attain the academic level of grade III in the formal school. The education approach of the centre is more non formal and children spend two hours in the centre for six days in a week. Attendance rate in the school is always low because it is dependent on the willingness of the employer.

### **Major activities**

The organization mostly engaged in teaching domestic workers in a part of Dhaka city. This is a challenging work for them for the employers are very much reluctant to let their domestic workers attend school. In order to convince them they hold seminars, advocacy meetings and personal visits to the domestic employers' house. Other than education programme Shoishab publishes a monthly bulletin for the learners and other people. This bulleting contains articles, stories and poetries written by the learners.

#### NFE programme and target group

This project is designed for education support for disadvantaged urban children living outside of their own families and working for other family as domestic servant. This work provides them their own living and some financial support for their own families. There are 600 domestic workers of which 80% are girls and 20% are boys.

Shoishab Bangladesh run their school mostly in Rampura and Shajahanpur area of Dhaka city. The school, if it is said so, works at someone's residential place – either in a garage or an unused room where barely 10-12 persons can sit comfortably. But the room is too little for 20 students to sit, move and study. Shoishab has 30 each centre or school in the locality. These schools run for three years where the learners achieve education up to a level of grade III comparable to primary school. But in reality their competency in some respect (Mathematic, and English) remains far below to that level. There is a small chalk board to write and mats to sit on the floor. However, there is a provision of fan and light for the benefit of children. Accept one or two places no school room has any visual learning materials like posters or charts for the children. The school room does not possess any other facility like open space to play or separate toilets or drinking water provisions. The teacher mentioned that they have jar full of drinking water in case of necessity.

# Quality of education and curriculum

The quality of education in the school is at stake because learners vary to a great extent in terms of achievement. This variation in learners' achievement occurs due to their age, ability and support from their house mistress. Still under such circumstances many learners could be able to read and write Bangla with satisfactory level. This school largely emphasizes on Bangla reading and writing. The course duration is three years, which comprises of three Bangla primers. Math is included within these primers. An important part of this curriculum is creation of awareness to various daily life activities. Along with this awareness, child rights, their responsibility at home and behaviour with other people are taught in the school. English is not taught from the notion that it is not required in their home. It is difficult to mainstream the children from this school because either their age is more or their level of achievement is low in comparison to the formal school. Life skill based education is much more emphasized and many of the children prefer it. Completion of this course even is a great challenge. So children with different level of competence study in the same class as a mixed group.

Teaching learning activity is conventional and largely rote in nature. Teacher with little training perform their duties in the class as they had in their school life in the past. Apparently no teaching aids are used and use of group work or play while learning in the class is minimum.

Shoishab has a small education team. The teacher is reportable to Programme Officer. They follow a weekly and monthly target to prepare the lesson plan designed in the curriculum. There is a mechanism of maintaining daily lesson plan in the classroom. The NGO follows their own curriculum to fulfill the learners' education. Teachers discuss child rights and other relevant issues in the class. There is no co-curricular activity but they have provision of children club where children have some opportunity to read and learn extra information with some additional funs.

Inclusiveness is not addressed in the programme neither they have any disabled children in the class. This is particularly a programme for the domestic worker, where disabled children have no scope to work. However, children with low intelligence and learning disability are present in the class but they do not receive any extra facility as is given in the inclusive school.

#### Student achievement and their participation in programme

Students' performance in class is measured through monthly examinations. Examination record is kept through register. On the other hand, teachers' observation is also a mechanism to assess learners' performance. There is no record keeping system for the weak learners but the teacher give additional effort to remove the child's weakness. Students' achievement in other areas like drawing, reciting, household manners, various domestic functions etc. are remarkable.

### Teacher training and their performance

Like other NFE projects teacher training in Shoishab Bangladesh also suffers from various weaknesses. They provide only five days for foundation training for teachers which follows by half a day per month as refreshers training. This foundation training is unlikely to provide necessary teaching skills to the teachers or facilitators. Teachers' half day monthly refresher training is also inadequate to provide them necessary instruction for the next month activity. Besides this training teachers receive subject wise training on child right, vocational activities, etc. from various partner organizations.

# **Community participation**

Significant community members are involved in the project at various stages. As the learners are engaged in the families of community as domestic worker, approval from the family for their education is critical. Group Organizers arrange monthly meeting at different employers' houses in tern. In these meetings significant community leaders like Word Commissioner or political leaders are invited to discuss about the importance of education of the domestic worker. In order to convince the people towards the objective of the programme the meeting is led by the Executive Director of the Shoishab Bangladesh.

#### 7. UDDIPAN

Uddipan started their work as a non profit voluntary organization in 1984 and their education programme begins from 1991. The target beneficiaries of the project are the marginalized children who are at the risk of becoming child labour, victim of sexual exploitation and trafficking, parents/gurardians, community people and duty bearer in local level. The major activities are education, nutrition, awareness on CR, local level advocacy. The activities are implemented in 7 unions under Daudkandi upazila, Comilla district; 6 unions under Banskhli upazila, 4 unions under Chandnaish upazila and 5 unions under Satkania upazila, Chittagong district; 9 unions under Bheramara upazila and 5 unions under Daulatpur upazila, Kustia district, and 9 unions under Kachua upazila, Chandpur district.

Uddipan works with the children within the age range between 8 and 15. Children who could not enroll in due time or who are dropped from any grade in primary school are targeted for education programme. Uddipan's education

is a non formal type and run for five years. Children are enrolled in grade one and then continue up to grade five. After completion of this grade many are enrolled in either primary or secondary school. They have 60 schools in Chittagong district each having 30 children. The average age range of the children in a school is 8 to 15.

### **Major activities**

Uddipan's major activities are many. Amongst them schooling is the vital work. Most of the children in a catchment area who are not enrolled in any school or dropped out from any primary school are considered for their education programme. The education programme of Uddipan has some resemblance with the BRAC's NFE setup in both rural and urban areas. Their school runs for three years with a single batch and children enrolled in first year attains the third grade education within this period. Other than the education programme Uddipan run credit programme for the parents of the NFE schools.

### Status of school and quality of education

The schools are mostly specious bamboo wall and tin roof house in the community. The organization provided support to build the single room school in a suitable place. Thirty children can sit in each class room; and they sit in a 'U' fashion on the mat in floor. The class rooms are quite sufficient for the 30 children. Children can play or perform in the middle. There are some drawings done by the children hang on the bamboo wall of the class room. There is a small chalkboard to write but its condition could have been better. Teacher uses lesson plan to teach but that plan seems to be uniform to all the centre/school. The tendency of teaching is very much rote and traditional in nature. In the observed school the teacher was trying to explain the term 'child abuse' but the explanation was not clear enough for the younger children. Teacher was trying to repeat the same example to illustrate the event.

In order to make the teaching learning more participatory a teacher is supposed to talk less and allow the students to discuss, ask questions, explain but the situation is quite opposite here teacher explains and ask questions. Students were not found to ask any question nor were they encouraged to ask. The quality of question also seems to be poor, i.e., mostly closed and knowledge based. There should have more comprehending and explanatory type questions in the process.

Good quality teaching always require use of teaching aids in the class but in this situation the absence of teaching aids seems to be acute. In this respect there are ample scopes of using charts, posters, models or the real object in the class. However, teachers mentioned that they do not have sufficient fund to prepare those materials for the children. Instead of using sufficient teaching aids or more interactive teaching methods teachers engaged the children in co-curricular activities like, reciting, singing or dancing and sometime taking

them out for study visit. These activities encourage the learners more to attend the class regularly. However, if any child is found absent for a short while the teacher made a visit to his/her home for the reason. In this regard both teacher and centre committee member give time to bring the irregular child to school.

Children assessment is done through regular examinations both monthly and terminal. However, there is no systematic process of continuous evaluation in the class but teachers use their common sense to identify weak learner and give them some additional time to coach. According to the teachers (attended in the focus group discussion) over four fifth of the students pass in the examination and get promotion to the higher grade. The students who could not pass also get promotion but they are given more attention to overcome the weakness in the previous grade.

Uddipan has success story of mainstreaming the children to the formal school after the completion of the education in the NFE centre. According to their report about 90% of the children are mainstreamed to different grades in nearby primary school. However, their sustainability in school is not documented. Another point is that only fewer children from the NFE schools can qualify to get admission in grade III in primary school.

### Curriculum and teaching learning activities

Like other NGOs Uddipan also use NCTB curriculum and government primer for the learners in their schools. In this case also they adapted the curriculum and use it in association with other curriculum including their own method. The adaptation is done by their own experts using their field experiences. Such method of adaptation of curriculum may not be appropriate for achieving the highest attainment. The children have the opportunity to use lot of supplementary learning materials through the children's club. However, some young children cannot attend the club regularly for distance, others manage to travel the little distance and enjoy the facility. The size of the club house is not sufficiently large for the all the children of a centre at a time.

Efficient dissemination of curriculum largely depends on the quality of teacher and supervisor but like other NGOs Uddipan also could not overcome the problem to provide good quality teacher with sufficient training.

#### Issues of inclusion and child rights

Inclusiveness is not present in the Uddipan's education programme. They enroll largely the poor children who could not attend primary school due to financial constraints or the children who dropped from school for the same reason. Uddipan provide the second chance of education to these unfortunate learners. However, all categories of children irrespective of their religion, cast and creed attend the school but no disabled child has been enrolled in the school. According to their view neither the teachers nor the supervisors have

any training on disability on the basis of which they can handle the children with special needs.

### Teacher training and their performance

The teachers receive an 8 day basic training to become teachers. This training deals with many issues like classroom management, dissemination of curriculum, teaching method, child psychology, assessment and evaluation etc. It is very difficult for the low profile teachers to receive appropriate training within such a short time. The training may be called orientation rather a full-fledged teacher training. The organization claims that the training deficiency is handled by a 4-day refresher training per year. Besides that teacher gathered in the office once a month to collect their wage and in that occasion they get some instruction on how to teach the next month's lesson. This meeting is termed as monthly refresher training.

### **Community participation**

The Uddipan has good contact with local community people and has created a good image as education provider to their children. There is a committee called centre management committee who look after the school's various activities in the village and help teacher to bring the children to school, negotiate with the local power structures to provide possible facilities to the school. The committee also includes some children for the sake of their participation. The group occasionally meets to discuss about the educational problems in the school and support the children in case of any difficulty arises from their family. Local community people are quite happy with the organizational effort and there is a pressure from their side to enroll more children in the school or establish more school in the community for the never enrolled children. There are instances of transferring children from regular school to the Uddipan's NFE schools. It also indicates good reputation in favour of the organization from the community.

#### 8. **BPF**

The Bangladesh Protibondhi Foundation is one of the few organizations that work with the disabled children. The organization was established in 1984 and they started the education programme with the SCSD in 1999. BPF's major task is education of the disabled children particularly the intellectually retarded ones. Other than the schooling of disabled children they run clinic for diagnosis of disability and Physio Therapy, provides distance training for the parents and vocational training for the disabled children. Besides running the

special school for the mentally retarded school BPF established an inclusive school at Mirpur for the general and special children.

The school under BPF includes children having various types of intellectual disability ranging between one year and 18 years. The school is a special type school and also BPF runs one inclusive school where both normal and special children are enrolled. The school has six grades, pre-primary to class V.

### **Major activities**

Among major activities BPF has diagnostic service for any type of disability, education and early intervention programme, parental education programme, distance education for the disabled children and teacher training programme.

# The state of the school and quality of education

The inclusive school of the Foundation is situated at Mirpur in Dhaka. It has a small campus with a few tin shed houses and a small building. They are waiting to erect the school building with external financial assistance, which is almost due. Therefore, the current status of the school is very much ad hock. The rooms are not suitable for any class to run; only a space is available to keep the students seated. There are deficiencies of furniture, play materials, teaching aids etc. however, they mentioned that things will improve when the new building will be constructed.

This is the only school where inclusive principle is practiced. They have 186 students of which 100 are boys and 86 girls. About 10% of the students are retarded having various types of intellectual disability. The school contains two exclusively special classes where physical, intellectual and developmentally disabled children receive education and when a child improves to mild category he/she is transferred to the inclusive class. An inclusive class consists of general ability students (of various numbers) and 10 to 20 percent disabled children. Usually the disabled child sits with the age mates irrespective of his/her intellectual ability. The classes are arranged into six grades, nursery to grade five. In the lower grades they have more children (up to 35) than the higher grades. In class five there are only five students. The general students come from lower income group and the disabled children come from the middle to higher middle income group families. The tuition is received from the disabled children but he general children are free.

This is a formal primary school having some modifications to fit the disabled children in class. Teacher goes by syllabi in class for the general students but the special child in the class receives education according to his/her ability. The teacher keeps an eye on the child by giving proper attention and not to disturb him/her by any means. The special child participates in class discussion, group work, class work, home work and all types of activities undertaken both inside and outside class. The special child appears in any examination with full seriousness but the achievement does not hamper

his/her promotion to the higher grade. During class observation it appeared that neither teacher nor the students fill disturbed with the presence of the special child in class, moreover, the general students cooperate with the child for any task.

Teaching in the inclusive school requires very special training on the part of the teacher and modified classroom environment; i.e., the classroom has to be specious, teacher student ratio has to be within range (1: 20-25 at the highest), lot of teaching aids and interactive teaching learning strategy should be adopted. However, in this case BPF school teachers try to keep the norm but in the absence of space and learning materials they cannot perform very well. Teaching has been found similar to the conventional schools and students engaged in rote learning. Lecture is the main method of teaching though they have some other means like group work, home work and individual exercises in the class.

Students' performance in the school is average, most of the students pass with good marks and promoted to higher grades. The school has good reputation among the parents of both the able and disabled children. After completing grade V students get admission to high school but the problem remains with the special children. Mainstreaming is difficult with these groups of children. BPF School has strong lobby with the neighbouring schools to enroll the special children, so far a few of them were admitted into the regular schools. In this regard unless the training on special and inclusive education is given to the general school teachers the situation will not be improved.

#### Curriculum and teaching learning activities

The curriculum is simple for the BPF Inclusive School; they use the national NCTB curriculum along with the government books. Besides that some supplementary reading books are also used for the children. However, the same curriculum is not used for the special children rather they are given separate curriculum according to their ability.

According to the teachers' report there are ample scopes of co-curricular activities for the children. They have weakly classes on art and music; students observe various national days and cultural events. Yearly sports and other events are also organized for the children and in every event the special children have equal opportunity to take part. The matter of child rights and self protection etc. are discussed in the school through various seminars and meetings.

#### Teacher training and their performance

All the teachers in this inclusive school are trained for about a year. They have one year B. S. Ed. (Batchelor of Special Education) degree obtained from Dhaka and National University. Other then this training teachers also obtained various other short course training from the organization and partner

organizations. The quality of teaching also depends upon the regular monitoring and effective supervision. There is a supervisor who regularly monitors the progress of the teachers and students in the school. But in the absence of permanent setup the quality of education cannot be maintained.

## **Community participation**

The major shortcoming of the school is that it does not possess any school managing committee taking outside members rather they have a mothers' club for the special children only. In the absence of SMC they have poor link with the community people. However, the people living in the neighbourhoods are aware about the school and know their activities. In the absence of good campus and link with the higher income group people students from their families do not intend to come to this school for their education. Only the children from poor families attend the school to save tuitions.

# 9. BITA

Bangladesh Institute of Theater Arts (BITA) was established in 1995 with an objective to provide alternative education to children and community through performing arts. This education also falls under the category of non formal education but the medium is quite unconventional. The target beneficiaries of the project are the children of both urban and rural areas. Two categories of children in rural areas are included in this group like students from primary and secondary schools belong to poor and low middle class families. In urban area the children come from slums whose family previously migrated from outside Chittagong. Another category of children comes from low income group in the community, majority of whom fall under the domain of child labour, sexual abuse and exploitation and trafficking. Other then children the target group includes parents, community people, teacher, school management committee, civil society, GO, NGOs and CBOs. The main activities include classroom drama in the school, campaign and awareness building in favour of CR, local level advocacy etc. Moreover, staff capacity building is also an important activity for the project. The activities are implementing in the ward no. 2 under Chittagong City Corporation, Potiva and Rangunia Thana in Chittagong district.

### Type and quality of education

Unlike other education theater approach creates the educational message for children and plays it within the class in front of a large group of students. The message deals with various important social issues like child labour, child abuse, exploitation of children, aids, diarrhea, etc. A group of trained performers organize the role play in the class through which the pertinent message is delivered. Within the play colourful aids like costumes, puppets, back sean, shadow drama etc. are used as a medium of instruction. As the approach involves various medium and lasts for a short while it draws children's attention and emotion to a great extent. After and during performance the role players involve the children in an interactive communication and evaluation of the act. This approach has been proved to be very effective way of teaching and learning of complex concepts.

Organizers initially communicate with the authority of the school and arrange time and space for the performance. Similar performance is done for the community people as well. After the performance the team comes back again in couple of months to the same audience to follow-up the action. According to the report of the programme coordinator children never forget the message and try to reform their behaviour as per instruction.

#### Curriculum and related issue

Naturally BITA's education programme does not follow a separate curriculum. They depend on the prevailing curriculum and contemporary issues to identify the necessary message. In this way they not only handle the social issue, scientific, cultural, historical and even literary issues are also dealt with in this theater approach. However, depending upon the audience the materials message and medium varies. Prior to performing the act the performer team meets in a workshop to prepare the whole exercise.

#### Training of the workers

It is a difficult task to perform without any training. The performers took long time to develop themselves through various workshops and training courses. Orientation training is also required for the school teachers and management people prior to undertake such an innovative exercise.

### **Community participation**

BITA has a good link with community in Chittagong Hill Track area. They perform there similar act with different types of beneficiaries like children of ethnic origin, parents, teachers of primary and secondary schools, karbari (village head), head and local power structure, community people and professional. At this level the main activities are identification of the major causes of rights violation of the ethnic children, cooperation and coordination with different stakeholders, campaign and awareness of child rights.

# **Discussion and Policy Implications**

Government has given emphasis on providing primary and basic education to all children eligible for primary age group. Considering from this perspective large number of NGOs along with the government came forward to provide basic education to all children. Besides all the efforts still around 20 percent of children within primary school age range are out of school for various reasons. Amongst them the disadvantageous group and hard to reach working children along with the children suffering from physical and mental retardation pose a big challenge in the educational provisions. Though the intention is to educate these difficult groups is there yet the preparation and professional support for such a difficult task are not sufficiently available. Development partner like SCSD came forward to support education for these disadvantaged and disabled children but with limited fund and technical resources.

Nine NGOs are engaged in providing basic primary education to the children having various psychological, social, financial, physical and time constraints. These children are difficult to reach for full time schooling and no unitrack curriculum (where common subjects are taught to all children) is suitable for them. These children have various needs and interests which have to be addressed for their education. SCSD provide financial support to some selected organizations for running education programme for all of these disadvantageous groups of children. Most of the NGOs have different models of education with little similarity but many of them commonly use NCTB curriculum in part along with the non formal education curriculum. Any curriculum is an integrated whole it cannot be used in part, unless the change is empirically tested. However, positive gains are achieved from such eclectic curriculum practice so; it requires some testing to establish the propriety of such use of curriculum. It is true that children have their own rights and have the right to merge with the mainstream formal education system but at the same time it has to be recognized that these disadvantaged children require different ladder to climb up. It is not humanly possible to bring all the children both form formal and non formal stream to one level of excellence, but it is expected that some from either group will excel and can be treated at the same level. But before that putting all the children - regular and disadvantageous, under the same curriculum would be challenging for most.

Each curriculum has its own philosophy, objectives, methodology and materials that suit its targeted population but when it is adopted for another unintended population it looses its effectiveness for both the groups. Separate groups require either independent curriculum with suitably linking points or an integrated inclusive curriculum that may incorporate all the groups under the same umbrella. All the curricula must have the expected competencies aiming at the ultimate goal but not necessarily the same ones. If the SCSD NFE

project continues for some longer period then it is necessary to review and streamline the curricula that are partially or fully used by the NGOs.

Learning materials for any education programme should have direct link to the curriculum. If the materials are prepared independent of curriculum or taken from other sources that are not formally linked to the curriculum then it would be challenging for the teachers and students to reach the goal with substantial knowledge and skill. Children in the formal and non formal schools are different in nature and quality so the materials cannot be interchangeably used as is done by many NGOs under this SCSD programme. Basic primers on language, mathematics, environmental studies all need to be developed targeting the disadvantaged group of children leading towards terminal competencies. In the absence of such practice children finishing particular grade in NFE school cannot continue from the following grade in the mainstream school rather they would swing among several grades below the targeted grade. On the other hand the older children who would not be fitted to the mainstream would not find any competent place to continue their education and would be dropped out from the system with a potential threat to relapse into illiteracy again. A competent curriculum for this disadvantaged vulnerable group of children will put them in track and will lead them to a terminal stage with a sense of completion of education.

The purpose of teaching English in NFE school is to provide the children with some additional skills to cope with the functional aspects of life. But for some children it is needed as one of the major competences to continue their education in the main stream school. Therefore, learning English with particular standard (e.g., ability to read a paragraph) should be allowed for some programme and not for the others. Teaching English flat for all group would simply jeopardize the children's progress in the NFE school. Similar arguments may be raised in favour of Mathematics too. Children who would likely to continue their education in the mainstream school would go for standard math syllabus otherwise all the children in class should not struggle with the difficult arithmetic problems. Now how to resolve such multiple skill teaching is an issue of inclusive education curriculum.

It is observed from various research findings that the students' quality largely depends on the teacher effectiveness. Non formal education is no exception of that sort. Unfortunately, here in NFE the most vulnerable and poorly qualified individuals are selected to become teachers. This may bring the teacher training to less effective business. So attention has to be given to employ more qualifies teachers and providing them sufficiently good training for better result. The question of sustainability of qualified teachers in the in NFE project has to be resolved with appropriate financial and technical support.

Learners' participation in the inclusive type of education is critical for their development which is not appropriately taking place equally in all the projects. Most of the schools run in slums densely populated areas and hence face tremendous crisis of space in the school/class. This has to be resolved by providing appropriate space for schooling, if finding a suitable space is not

possible in the location then number of children may be adjusted to the space rather than keeping the approved proportion intact. Children's mobility in classroom or space to act and move is helpful for quality learning. Along with this frequent outing should also be involved what is now missing in the programme.

Concerning children's participation in various school work it shows that they have little opportunity to be involved in various activities like day to day administration, development of policy, preparation of curriculum etc. Though most of the teachers and supervisors received training on child rights, child participation etc. yet it is not largely implemented due to the absence of clear guidance in the curriculum. It is necessary to provide direction in the curriculum for the teachers how to involve children in various activities. However, children's club is an excellent place to bring this concept of child participation in and this is one of the major areas what is demonstrated by the NGOs for their achievement in the aspect of children's participation.

Involving community in the NGO's education programme is a challenge in the urban areas. Therefore, it is only parents and employers who keep contact with the school for the betterment of their incumbent. The contact is higher in case of organizations that provide credit to the parents. Community's involvement is nothing but supporting the education programme morally but they do not give any other support in cash or kind. The contact with the school however, enhanced the attendance of children in school. Occasionally the school invites the local leaders like ward commissioner in the meetings and observance of national events in the school. That helps the school to remain undisturbed from the unwanted local miscreants.

Lastly the review provides a better insight about SCSD's non formal education and its achievement. So far the programme creates an enthusiasm among the children and parents who failed to provide education to their poor kids. Children who received education have become potential learners; it brought about a change in their lives and provided them a sort of self respect and dignity towards empowerment. But the NGOs who have come forward with the mission of education are very much concerned about the future of the programme because of the absence of long term financial commitment from the donor. An education programme should have a perspective plan at least for five years so that permanent effect on children can be demonstrated. The yearly commitment for the project from SCSD's side makes the NGO short sighted and remains limited to gross level activities only. Moreover, long term commitment would also help attract the workers to sustain in the project and they get time to prepare the children accordingly.

One more important aspect of the SCSD's NFE programme is that it needs to be supervised and monitored continuously by an individual or a group of individuals who have better insight about non formal and inclusive education. Such supervision will also help the NGOs to modify their activities and remain in track while running the programme.

### Recommendations

The following are few recommendations that are forwarded to improve the project activities at large and develop the quality of education in specific.

- 1. Non formal and inclusive education is a new strategy in the education programme, it requires thorough knowledge and understanding of education, psychology, disability and clear conception about the under privileged children's community in the society. Organizations who work in this area are not rightly oriented with all these disciplines and hence rely on a person who has some experiences in this field. In order to get good result from the project the initial requirement is to recruit persons with sufficient pedagogical background and develop them through continuous training for inclusive and non formal education projects. There is shortage of such persons in both SCSD as well as in their partner organizations. Therefore, sufficiently trained personnel in the field of education are to be produced through internal and overseas training on inclusive, non formal and child rights based education.
- 2. The classroom environment among most of the partners' school is very poor. Children sit on mat in an un-specious room having no or little space to move and work. Arrangement for an acceptable classroom should be made so that children can have an idea of better schooling even in a non formal setting.
- 3. Other then books an chalkboard teachers have very little materials to use as teaching aids. In order to build up concepts teachers should use large number of teaching aids in class. Provisions should be created to procure more teaching learning for effective teaching in class.
- 4. At present SCSD partners are using various curricula for their non formal education programmes. How far these curricula are suitable for the disadvantageous group of children is not very clear so in this respect a unified standardized curriculum is required. This can be done by developing a standardized, right based and inclusive curriculum for the underprivileged and discriminated group of children. SCSD in collaboration with a specialized institute or group of curriculum experts may develop the curriculum for the purpose. While developing a new inclusive education curriculum for the disadvantaged group of children former DNFE curricula and their primers may be used as a stop gap arrangement.
- 5. There is crisis of basic learning materials like primers for the children in the SCSD's NFE programme. Falling under such circumstances NGOs tend to use materials developed by NCTB, BRAC, Dhaka Ahsania Mission or some other sources which are not equally competent to be standard primers. In this regard appropriate primers have to be selected and specified on the basis of standardized curriculum for the whole programme so that the learners' achievement can be compared at a later stage.

- 6. In order to make the teaching more effective it would have been better if one type of primer could be utilized for a particular age group of children for all the organizations. SCSD may consider a unified type of curriculum and specific primers for their own funded programme instead of giving them liberty to use any materials.
- 7. There is a scope for using supplementary learning materials for the NFE learners through the club but it was observed that a significant number of children could not avail the chance due to distance or time constraint. If the proportion of children's club can be increased then it is possible to bring them at the doorsteps of children. In this case at least one child club should be established for at least five NFE centres for successful use of supplementary learning materials.
- 8. Teacher training in the SCSD NFE projects suffer from various shortcomings like shorter duration, availability of experience trainers and good training materials. So in order to provide appropriate training for teachers a third party experienced in TOT or a professional training organization may be assigned to do the job. Before the training is on the syllabus has to be developed with the emphasis on inclusive education. However, the NFE curriculum has to be prepared first prior to giving effective teacher training.
- 9. As the teachers are poorly qualified in the partners organizations their training should be rigorous and sufficiently prolonged to supplement the lack of formal education with any degree.
- 10. Children's club is an excellent idea for developing the quality of their education and future. As the numbers of clubs are few the opportunities cannot be availed by a large number of them. In order to bring the opportunity to the doorsteps of the children more clubs are to be set up and multiple facilities (like vocational and a vocational training, dissemination of various advocacy materials, recreation etc.) have to be created for maximum benefit.
- 11. Mainstreaming of children graduated from the NFE schools has created a challenge for enrolling them in appropriate grade and sustaining them in the school for the stipulated time. The challenges come from the educational level of the student, his/her socio-cultural status and accommodating schooling hour for the working child. The situation can be tackled by establishing a high school with non formal modality in the same locality. Selected number of children graduating from several primary levels NFE schools (as it is not possible or plausible to mainstream cent percent of children to high school) can be enrolled in this non formal high school (NFHS) and can continue their education for at least next five years. This opportunity will provide flexible school timing and comparable teaching learning exercises with previous school.
- 12. The idea of inclusiveness is not complete among the partners and the teachers of the NFE schools. For that matter children with diversified abilities are not included in the same school or in the same class rather children with similar disabilities, coming from same disadvantaged community or equal ability groups are taken exclusively for education. This strategy should be changed to inclusive approach where children from diversified ability grouping would be included. In order to do this

- separate training on inclusive education has to be provided for the teachers, supervisors and managers of the organization.
- 13. The amount of vocational training provided by the partners is limited to some trades only this can be increased to more vocations depending upon the availability of jobs and likings of the children. Partner organization may higher external experts to provide those training for the willing children.
- 14. The emphasis on disability is very limited in the programme except one no other organization receives disabled children in their school. This is because the people working over there are either not appropriately qualified in handling disability or do not have sufficient materials for the children having specific kind of disability. Therefore, the SCSD NFE programme should draw the attention of the organizations that at least 5% of the children in each class should be taken from the disabled community (either physical or intellectual) and for that matter all teachers and supervisors should receive training on the subject of special and inclusive education. IER, Dhaka University provides a weeklong training on Special and Inclusive Education for the teachers and social workers that may be explored for the SCSD partners.